PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

SURVEY OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE BATHOPELE POLICY

AUGUST 2000
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Glossary of terms used in the report ................................................................. vii

Executive summary ............................................................................................... ix

Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1
1. Brief .................................................................................................................. 2
2. Aims of the project .......................................................................................... 2
3. Departments covered by this report ............................................................... 3
4. Methodology ..................................................................................................... 4
5. Structure of the report ..................................................................................... 5

Part I: Department of Correctional Services ....................................................... 6
1. Background ....................................................................................................... 7
2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle .................................................... 7
3. Corruption ........................................................................................................ 12
4. Implementation at service delivery points ....................................................... 12
5. Good practice examples .................................................................................. 17
6. Constraints/problems ....................................................................................... 18
   6.1 Inexperienced managers ............................................................................ 19
   6.2 Infrastructure ............................................................................................. 19
   6.3 Overcrowding of prisons .......................................................................... 20
   6.4 Attention by management to the community correction services .......... 21
   6.5 Lack of IT Technology .............................................................................. 21
   6.6 The organisational design ........................................................................ 22
   6.7 Staffing ratio .............................................................................................. 22
   6.8 Lack of addresses ....................................................................................... 22
   6.9 Reluctance of community to get involved ................................................ 22
   6.10 Imposing of sentences ............................................................................. 23
# Table of Contents

6.11 Lack of transport .................................................................23  
6.12 Aids .....................................................................................23  
7. Recommendations ...........................................................................24  
  7.1 Service Delivery Improvement Programme ........................24  
  7.2 Guidelines ............................................................................24  
  7.3 Information .............................................................................24  
  7.4 Training ..................................................................................25  
  7.5 Utilisation of the community structures ...........................25  
  7.6 The management of the justice system ...............................25  
  7.7 Youths awaiting trial .................................................................25  
  7.8 Utilisation of resources .............................................................26  

Part II: South African Police Service (SAPS) ..................................................27  
  1. Background ....................................................................................28  
  2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle ...............................33  
  3. Corruption .....................................................................................38  
  4. Good practice examples .................................................................38  
  5. Constraints/problems .................................................................40  
  6. Recommendations ........................................................................40  

Part III: Department of Justice .................................................................41  
  1. Background ....................................................................................42  
  2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle ...............................42  
  3. Corruption .....................................................................................45  
  4. Implementation at service delivery points .................................45  
  5. Good practice example .................................................................46  
  6. Constraints/problems .................................................................46  
    6.1 Constraints emanating from the Department itself ..........46  
    6.2 Constraints emanating from outside the Department ..........57
TABLE OF CONTENTS

7. Recommendations...........................................................................................................60
   7.1 Batho Pele White Paper..........................................................................................60
   7.2 Policy impact...........................................................................................................61
   7.3 Places of safety for juveniles..................................................................................61
   7.4 Prosecutors vis-à-vis magistrates..........................................................................61
   7.5 Standards................................................................................................................62
   7.6 Information ..............................................................................................................62
   7.7 Human resources.....................................................................................................63
   7.8 Budget.......................................................................................................................64
   7.9 Services rendered by other departments...............................................................65
   7.10 One-stop service....................................................................................................65

Part IV: Department of Home Affairs.............................................................................66
   1. Background................................................................................................................67
   2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle...............................................................67
   3. Corruption..................................................................................................................72
   4. Implementation at service delivery points....................................................................73
   5. Good practice examples..............................................................................................73
   6. Constraints/problems..................................................................................................73
   7. Recommendations......................................................................................................77

Part V: Provincial Departments of Education .................................................................81
   1. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle...............................................................82
   2. Corruption..................................................................................................................84
   3. Constraints/problems..................................................................................................84
   4. Recommendations......................................................................................................86

Part VI: Provincial Departments of Health ......................................................................88
   1. Background..................................................................................................................89
   2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle ...............................................................89
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Good practice example</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Constraints/problems</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Recommendations</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part VII: Batho Pele Pilot Departments of the North West Provincial Administration</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Department of Developmental Local Government and Housing</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Recommendation</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Department of Economic Development and Tourism</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Department of Finance</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Department of Safety and Security</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Department of Transport and Civil Aviation (DT &amp; CA)</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General conclusions and recommendations</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Support to departments</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Integration of the SDIP with other management initiatives in departments</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Alignment of service delivery capacity with the SDIP</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Identifying the improvement gap and how to achieve the improvement to bridge the gap</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Applying the Batho Pele principles should make a practical difference</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The Batho Pele principles should be integrated into the performance management system of the Department</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A Project description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C List of service delivery points visited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GLOSSARY OF THE TERMS USED IN THE REPORT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABET</td>
<td>Adult Basic Education Training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Batho Pele</td>
<td>White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPF</td>
<td>Community Policing Forum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPO</td>
<td>Community Police Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>Someone outside (external) or within (internal) an organisation who receives and uses its products and services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSCCU</td>
<td>Customer Service Charter for Court Users.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCS</td>
<td>Department of Correctional Services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPW</td>
<td>Department of Public Works.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDL</td>
<td>Essential Drug List.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact</td>
<td>The results (negative or positive) of programme activities as experienced by clients and society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KZN</td>
<td>KwaZulu-Natal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
<td>Statement of specific results to be achieved over a specified period of time - answering both “what” and “when”, quantitatively and qualitatively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHC</td>
<td>Primary Health Care.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMC</td>
<td>Participative Management Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy</td>
<td>A strategy that defines the way the organisation carries out its mandate. Policies are designed to achieve national goals, and may often not be focussed on a programme’s content.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS</td>
<td>South African Police Service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDIP</td>
<td>Service Delivery Improvement Programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGB</td>
<td>School Governing Body.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Background and introduction

The Public Service Commission undertook a survey from October 1999 to February 2000 to look at the degree to which government departments are implementing the proposals made in the White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery - Batho Pele.

This project was aimed at evaluating departmental compliance with the White Paper and at obtaining baseline information on progress in transforming public service delivery.

The executive summary highlights some of the findings and conclusions on the principles promoted in the White Paper. These are:

- consultation;
- clear standards;
- access;
- courtesy;
- information;
- openness and transparency;
- redress; and
- value for money.

Corruption was also surveyed.

The survey’s findings are described in this document in relation to each principle in turn. This summary shows that while progress has been made to put a framework in place for transforming public service delivery, much remains to be done. The principles remain valid and their importance is emphasized by the survey findings.

2. Why this project was undertaken

The project’s aim was to evaluate the performance of the departments indicated in paragraph three in implementing the White Paper.

In addition, the project was also aimed at:

- evaluating compliance with the Batho Pele principles at grass-roots level service points;
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

• obtaining baseline information on service delivery issues; and
• making recommendations on service delivery improvement.

It must be emphasized that the survey looked at compliance with the processes required in terms of the White Paper for setting standards and determining targets for improvement, and did not assess whether the standards were actually met or whether users of services are satisfied or not.

3. Methodology

It was agreed that since the public service comprises 130 departments, it would not be possible to look at all of them. A diverse spread of departments was selected, with care being taken to ensure that the largest government services were included. Thus the survey covered the following government departments:

• Correctional Services
• SA Police Service
• Justice Department
• Home Affairs
• Provincial Education Departments
• Provincial Health Departments
• five North West provincial government departments identified by the White Paper as pilot departments, namely:
  ° Department of Developmental Local Government and Housing
  ° Department of Economic Development and Tourism
  ° Department of Finance
  ° Department of Safety and Security
  ° Department of Transport

Data was gathered through a survey/questionnaire completed by each Department, and through interviews with managers responsible for service delivery in each Department.

Approximately ten service points for each Department were also visited in most provinces. The researchers themselves randomly selected these, and care was taken to, once again, include a diverse mix of service points.
The survey was simply a comparison of actual practice in departments with the requirements in the White Paper. Only in two instances, customer surveys were undertaken. Actual performance against standards was not measured since very few departments could provide performance data. The findings do, however, provide a clear and useful picture of the state of public service delivery and its transformation that can be used to formulate a clear strategic response.

**CONCLUSION:**

*This survey should be undertaken annually, and should involve the awarding of points to departments on a systematic and fair basis. A good governance award could be presented to the highest achievers.*

4. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

The departments surveyed complied as follows with the Batho Pele principles:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME OF DEPARTMENT</th>
<th>Principles</th>
<th>Consultation</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>Courtesy</th>
<th>Information</th>
<th>Ope nness &amp; transparen cy</th>
<th>Red res</th>
<th>Value for money</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correctional Services</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S A Police Service</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justice Department</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Home Affairs</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Education Departments</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Health Departments</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORTH WEST DEPARTMENTS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental Local Government</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Development &amp; Tourism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety and Security</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LEGEND: The meaning of the above table regarding each of the Batho Pele principles, is as follows:

- Do they consult?
- Have they set standards?
- Have targets for increasing access been set?
- Have courtesy standards been set?
- Do they provide information?
- Has a citizens’ report been published?
- Are redress mechanisms in place?
- Do they measure value for money?

An empty block means NO.

4.1 Consultation

Batho Pele Principle: Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered.

(Citizens will be asked for their views on existing public services and may also tell the Public Service what new basic services they would like. All levels of society will be consulted and all feelings will be conveyed to Ministers, MECs and legislators.)

By requiring that Departments have a simple, implemented strategy to make a clear and visible link between what their clients want and what the Department provides, the White Paper is trying to ensure a close fit between demand and supply of public sector services. The explicit intention is to avoid a situation in which state resources are used to deliver unwanted or inappropriate services.

The findings of the survey suggest that, while departments appreciate and understand the need to consult with their clients, this is not happening at a level of real engagement.

Based on the survey findings, it cannot be argued that the services
provided by the public sector are tailored around a clear and ongoing dialogue with the users grass-roots level of those services.

The overall impression is of a commitment to consulting with clients, but of a general absence of a clear implementation strategy for developing ongoing dialogue with clients and their organizations. In some cases there are limited or inadequate institutional vehicles for doing so, such as a research programme or an annual meeting with Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs), but these lack real strategic content.

What was intended by the White Paper was a carefully considered and structured dialogue in which the services provided by the public service are based on the findings of ongoing consultations with the public. This approach will take some time to emerge.

The most promising structures to facilitate communication are the Community Policing Forums (CPF) and School Governing Bodies (SGB), adopted by the SAPS and the Department of Education respectively. In general however, these remain weak and fragile and lack the kind of dynamism needed to articulate clear visions, performance indicators, goals and strategies.

Departments do not consult on service standards and performance. Whilst the SGBs consult parents, no firm commitments are negotiated, such as to improve low pass rates in many schools with a certain percentage each year.

The view is that other departments should also establish bodies such as the SGBs and the CPFs. Despite their problems, they remain important formal links between the state and civil society that should also be explored by other departments.

**CONCLUSION:**

- Not enough is being done to consult public service customers about their needs. SGBs and CPFs are most advanced, but they remain fragile and in need of support.

- All departments should be encouraged to identify and use proper, formal consultative bodies, as proposed in the White Paper. This must include allocating resources to build the capacity of these bodies where necessary.
4.2 Standards

Batho Pele Principle: *Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect.*

*(All national and provincial government departments will be required to publish service standards for existing and new services. Standards may not be lowered! They will be monitored at least once a year and be raised progressively.)*

Standards have been set by Correctional Services, the SAPS and Home Affairs. In the case of the Justice Department and the provincial Education and Health Departments, very little work has been done on setting standards. Standards are not made public at service delivery points.

In these cases turnaround times and similar indicators are used to measure performance. In most such cases there is some kind of regular reporting on performance to targets. However, it is not made public.

Most departments have not consulted the users of their services adequately on what constitutes fair standards at service delivery point level, and this issue needs to be considered in relation to the points made regarding consultative mechanisms.

In many of the departments, work done on the setting of standards has not been completed. Norms and standards have been suggested, for example, but not adopted.

In most cases the monitoring and even the setting of standards relies on the discretion of local role-players, rather than any provincial or national framework. This is particularly true of the monitoring of standards in education. Where communities are weak these problems are most profound.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

4.3 Access

Batho Pele Principle: *All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled.*

*(Departments will have to set targets for extending access to public servants and public services. They should implement special programmes for improved service delivery to physically, socially and culturally disadvantaged persons.)*

The Department of Correctional Services sets targets for prisoners’ access to the services provided by it, for example access to education programmes.

The SAPS has implemented plans to move resources to high priority areas but police stations are still distributed unequally across communities. Most police stations visited are also not easily accessible for the physically handicapped.

No targets have been set by the Justice Department to improve access to services. Two important pieces of legislation have been enacted that require it to be able to offer a proper, quick service (Maintenance Act and Domestic Violence Act) and both improve access to the judicial system, but implementation capacity seems very limited.

While the Department of Home Affairs has tried to identify the problems preventing access to its services, it has yet to specify and set targets for improving access. This is also the case for the North West provincial administration departments surveyed.

In Education, the system is so fragmented and diverse that it cannot be
said that there is equal access to services. At present, there is a distinct need of focussing on the most disadvantaged schools, since these learners are the ones being most affected by the current quality of service provision. Most departments’ efforts should be towards upgrading the quality of education at these schools.

Many of the schools visited received textbooks very late in the year, whilst at one school there was only one textbook for the whole class.

Resources needed for effective health service delivery are either not available or not properly distributed. This often relates to poor planning and management, not necessarily to an absolute shortage of resources. These planning problems are also evident in the primary health care system, which should be working to reduce the pressure on the system.

Patients moved from hospitals to clinics are often unable to receive drugs at the clinics they were sent to, because clinic personnel cannot order specific scheduled drugs. These patients are therefore compelled to re-enter the hospital system to obtain the medication needed.

CONCLUSION:

- There is not equal access to public services, with a wide range of local and regional variations in terms of quality and coverage.
- Every department must make a clear commitment to improve access to services, particularly those which are seen as basic human rights, complete with improvement targets and resources where necessary.

4.4 Courtesy

Batho Pele Principle: Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration.
(All departments must set standards for the treatment of the public and incorporate these into their Codes of Conduct, values and training programmes. Staff performance will be regularly monitored, and discourtesy will not be tolerated.)

Correctional Services have not set standards for courtesy, but one of the departmental core values includes the recognition of human dignity.

SAPS has not published or displayed material regarding courtesy, although the survey suggests a number of ways in which courtesy is “planned for”. A programme for setting up trauma rooms is under way and officials are being trained in service delivery and victim empowerment. This has yet to show results.

The Customer Service Charter for Court Users (CSCCU) indicates some of the ways in which customers can expect to be dealt with. Besides this, no material has been developed that address the courtesy issue.

Home Affairs has specified standards for the way in which customers should be treated. The performance of staff who interact with customers is monitored in most regions of the Department. Courtesy and customer care are included in all training programs and additional training is given to those who deal with the public.

In Education, a code of conduct is used to advise teachers on appropriate behaviour, but little has been done in addition to this.

The North West Department of Health has set courtesy standards, although these are rarely adhered to or monitored. Generally courtesy standards in the health system are not seen to be high: the reasons for this include a high number of vacant posts and high absentee levels.

**CONCLUSION**

Ensuring courtesy is one of the basic and most easily achievable principles, and very important to public service customers. Departments must regularly undertake customer satisfaction surveys as part of an integrated monitoring and evaluation strategy. Such surveys should place a strong emphasis on courtesy.
4.5 Information

Batho Pele Principle: Citizens should be given full and accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive.

(The public will get full, accurate and up-to-date facts about services they are entitled to. Information should be provided at service points, in local media and in various official languages. Contact numbers and names should appear in all departmental communications.)

The Department of Correctional Services has compiled a number of brochures providing information on various aspects of its products and services.

The SAPS regularly communicates with its communities by means of pamphlets, posters, visits, use of local newspapers and radio stations, help lines and community police officers.

The Justice Department schedules open court days when the public can visit courts and learn about the legal processes. Pamphlets and posters are also used. In pilot cases, information desks have been tested.

The Department of Home Affairs publishes a number of documents that provide up to date and accurate information on their products and services. However, these are not available in all regions and offices.

Despite the many problems in the education system, school governing bodies have served to improve the quality of information flows between schools and parents. Schools also make extensive use of circulars to communicate with their learners’ parents.

In the health system, there are no mechanisms for effective communication between institutions and communities. Hospital Boards are seen as adequate vehicles for communication, whereas more could be done to improve the customer’s level of information, as is shown in cases where media, like radio, are used to good effect.

Only the pilot departments of Developmental Local Government and Housing and Finance of the North West Provincial Administration, have basic communication tools such as telephone lists, Batho Pele posters and departmental cell phone numbers for complaints. Information
dissemination strategies and mechanisms should be reviewed with the purpose of promoting effective communication with clients. There is a need to look beyond basic tools such as telephone lists.

CONCLUSION:

- There is a clear link between the consultation and information principles. Each consultative process must include a communication and information component. These must receive resources as necessary.

- Basic efforts have been made to provide information, although more needs to be done to move beyond mere contact lists.

- Departments must complete the consultation-information loop and engage properly with their clients on an ongoing basis.

4.6 Openness and transparency

Batho Pele Principle: Citizens should be told how national and provincial departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge.

(The public will have the right to know. Departmental staff numbers, particulars of senior officials, expenditure and performance against standards will not be secret. Reports to citizens will be widely published and submitted to legislatures.)
No citizens’ report has been published by the Department of Correctional Services.

Some police stations do display details on station management, although this is not always done. CPFs are the mechanisms through which relations with stations and their clients are fostered. Little information is provided on station budgets or on that of the SAPS as a whole.

The Department of Justice has done nothing yet with regard to citizens’ reports. This is also true of the provincial Departments of Health, which were found not to be open or transparent. Only one province published a Citizens’ Report.

Home Affairs does not have a formal report on its expenditure or performance, although some of the regions do have representative groups to which they report. Where this happens, it usually takes place annually.

Within the education system, many schools have made a lot of progress in improving their openness and transparency through improved communication and better use of governing bodies.

The North West Provincial Administration’s pilot departments did not publish a Citizens’ Report, except the Health Department.

CONCLUSION:

- Departmental Annual Reports should follow a standard, prescribed format, that should provide consistent, comparable data. This format has been proposed by the PSC in its recently released report on Government Annual Reports.

- In addition to the annual report, service delivery points should annually publish a two page citizens’ report, particular to the services rendered at that point.
4.7 Redress

Batho Pele Principle: *If the promised standard of service is not delivered, the client should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy. When complaints are made, the client should receive a sympathetic, positive response.*

*(Mechanisms for recording any public dissatisfaction will be established and all staff will be trained to handle complaints fast and efficiently. The client will receive regular feedback on the outcomes.)*

The only official complaint mechanisms used by the Department of Correctional Services are for prisoners. This involves the maintenance of a diary by section heads and also the use of complaints boxes. Innovations include the use of Participative Management Committees (PMCs) to improve communication with prisoners. Statistics on the effect of these systems are not available.

The SAPS has a detailed procedure for dealing with complaints. This involves the use of community police officers as well as the station commander in cases involving members of the public. Complaints are also received on provincial and national command level. The Independent Complaints Directorate also investigates complaints against members of the SAPS.

In the Department of Justice, the Customer Service Charter for Court Users (CSCCU) has a section dealing with complaints, but no office or system has been set up to deal with complaints. The Department’s commitment to dealing with complaints is formally expressed, but with no underlying substance.

The Department of Home Affairs has no nationwide formal mechanism for handling complaints. Some of the regional offices have set up their own systems for systematically reviewing incoming complaints. Although a toll-free number is available at national level, complaints are not followed up. Due to capacity constraints, complaints are not adequately addressed at this desk.

In the Education Departments, systems for handling complaints depend on the school concerned, since no formal complaint handling mechanism exists. Internal redress (from schools to the Departments) needs serious attention.

In the health system, with the exception of North West, redress
mechanisms are reactive (no formal procedures are laid down – complaints are handled as they occur) and records are poorly kept and managed. In very few instances information is provided on where complaints should be lodged and redress mechanisms are not displayed.

Only the Department of Finance of the Batho Pele pilot departments in the North West Provincial Administration has developed a formal complaints-handling system. At this stage the department is in the process of implementing the system.

CONCLUSION:

- Limited efforts have been made to provide complaints handling-mechanisms. Where these exist they rarely function effectively.
- As part of a broader support program, departments should be assisted to put complaints-handling systems in place.

4.8 Value for money

Batho Pele Principle: Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money.

(Citizens pay income tax, VAT and other taxes to finance the administration of the country. They have the right to insist that their money be used properly. Departments must prove that efficiency savings and improved service delivery are on the agenda.)

In the Department of Correctional Services no measurement of value for money has taken place. There is information available on certain ratios like staff to prisoner and unit costs, but these are not real measures of value. The Department is implementing the Asset Procurement and Operating Partnership System and the Prison Operating Partnership, both innovative schemes involving new ways of providing services traditionally offered by the state alone.
SAPS makes use of partnerships with its social stakeholders through the CPFs. While this does allow for increased access to resources and improved relations, it does not really address new ways of providing services. Increased attempts have been made to use more effective crime solving methods and strategies. Work has been done on policing indicators, which includes detailed expenditure analysis, and reports on staffing inputs and their costs.

Basic analyses of workloads are done in the Department of Justice, although regular, reliable data is not available. Performance has recently improved, although the reasons for this are not clear. The Department makes use of partnerships to provide additional resources and to build relationships with important groups. This includes relationships with the private sector as well as the NGOs. The Department also participates in donor funded NGO projects.

While the Department of Home Affairs has a service delivery improvement program, it does not identify areas of cost saving, although there is a number of initiatives planned. At present the Department does not systematically measure value for money.

The education departments reviewed as part of the survey do not undertake systematic measurements of value for money. The absence of an agreed-upon framework for doing so makes this very difficult.

Health departments calculate unit costs like cost per bed and cost per patient per day. The Kwa-Zulu Natal Health Department monitors the quality of services by accreditation of hospitals.

The North West Provincial Administration departments surveyed do not have plans for improving value for money.

It is clear that departments have not really started looking creatively and imaginatively at the options for providing services in new and exciting ways. More encouragement and support are probably needed before this will change.

**CONCLUSION:**
5. Corruption

The Department of Correctional Services has an anti-corruption policy, but the Inspecting Judge appointed, has not been replaced since his retirement two years ago. Investigations are consequently not up to date.

SAPS has a code of conduct that is signed by all members. There is an anti-corruption unit that functions. Performance indicators for fighting corruption have been set.

The Justice Department has no code of conduct but does have an Inspectorate used for anti-corruption work.

Education departments do not have codes of conduct to curb corruption. They have, however, done some inspections to counteract it.
Corruption does not appear to have been systematically addressed by the health departments.

CONCLUSION:

- Departments have generally put a basic mechanism in place to counter corruption, but these rarely work effectively or reliably.
- Corruption is to be addressed as part of a multi-faceted program including the projects proposed in the National Anti-Corruption Summit. It is furthermore proposed that a Risk Management Strategy be formulated as part of the management plan of each Department. This should clearly list the areas of risk and propose strategies to be put into place to combat them.

6. Constraints/problems

Apart from compliance with the Batho Pele principles, quite a number of issues affecting service delivery, were identified in the course of the survey and should be addressed by the relevant departments, or could be taken up by the Commission in its programme of investigations. The following are the major issues:

6.1 Department of Correctional Services

- A large number of the facilities of the Department of Correctional Services are old. Prisons were originally designed for incarceration
and not rehabilitation. Dining halls, visit facilities, libraries, workshops, education and training facilities as well as office space for professional workers are inadequate and are sometimes a security risk. This is not conducive to effective and efficient service delivery.

- Performance agreements with senior management were instituted. A number of managers indicated that their actual performance against these agreements are not regularly monitored or discussed with them.

- There is no structured involvement of community structures in the rendering of correctional services. The essence is not only safe custody of offenders, but to “correct” offenders by rehabilitation/developing them through education, training and supervision. The communities can be involved by participating in the education and training of prisoners and also the re-introduction of offenders back into the community.

6.2 Department of Justice

- The cost of new policies should be calculated before implementation, for example new policies on maintenance and domestic violence at the Department of Justice.

- Custody of juveniles.

- How to utilise court statistics to develop performance standards.

- Co-ordination between the different parts of the Justice System to increase the processing of cases through the system.

- A guideline on delegated powers must be developed and distributed to all magistrates’ offices.

- To alleviate the problem of inexperienced prosecutors a compulsory three months apprenticeship (internship) at the end of each academic year should be incorporated in the prosecutors’ study course over and above the present intensive, in-service training programme of twelve months.

- Service delivery improvement and service delivery capacity should be better aligned.
· The service delivery of the Departments of Public Works and Government Printing Works should be assessed.
· To accommodate the needs of the previously disadvantaged people in rural (small towns) and remote areas, a one-stop service between the SAPS and Departments of Justice, Home Affairs and Welfare, and other departments, should be considered.

6.3 Department of Health

· In all provinces, medicine and drug theft and the existence of crime syndicates in pharmacies are of great concern.
· The critical shortage of staff in hospitals has led to excessive overtime. A typical response to budget shortages is to place a moratorium on the filling of posts. There seems to be a lack of a planned and rational response to budget shortages, or lack of financial management capacity to work out and implement appropriate alternatives.
· The quota system used by some hospitals and clinics negatively affects access. After the daily quota has been reached, excess patients are sent home without having been seen by health personnel, and in some instances, pharmacies are unable to give medication as a result of having a quota system on the number of scripts they are permitted to fill per day.
· Different systems of linen supply, procurement, security of linen and laundering exist. The aim should be to assess whether de/centralisation, outsourcing or privatisation is a viable option and if so which particular aspects of the process need to be de/centralised, privatised or outsourced.

7. Main conclusions and recommendations

The Commission believes that action in the following areas could greatly facilitate implementation of the Batho Pele White Paper:

7.1 Support to departments

Finding
It was found that there is a general lack of practical skills in the public service to apply the Batho Pele principles.

Recommendation

To fulfill this need it is recommended that:

(1) The Department of Public Service and Administration establishes an appropriately resourced support programme.

(2) The programme must cover the following types of support:

• Assistance by consultants.

• Detailed guidelines on, for instance, consultation with customers and the setting of standards.

• Training in the practical aspects of applying the Batho Pele principles.

• Rigorous monitoring and evaluation of implementation of the White Paper.

7.2 Integration of the Service Delivery Improvement Programme with other management initiatives in departments

Finding

It was found that the Service Delivery Improvement Programme is frequently seen as a separate campaign from the normal day to day business of the department.

Recommendation

Since service delivery is the main business of departments it is recommended that:

(1) Their strategic and business objectives should include their service delivery objectives, that is the service standards, access targets and productivity improvement objectives to increase value for money required by the Batho Pele policy.

(2) All management measures, i.e. -
• strategic and business plans;
• budgets;
• organisation structure;
• transformation programme;
• human resources plan;
• facilities plans;
• business processes;
• job descriptions; and
• performance management

must be geared to service delivery.

(c) The results of consultation with customers should be analysed and presented in the form of management reports to policy and planning meetings where decisions about the type and level of service are taken.

7.3 Alignment of service delivery capacity with the Service Delivery Improvement Programme

Finding

It was found that departments frequently place demands for improved and even new services on service delivery units without calculating the full costs and impact of proposed changes. Heads of units cope with this by compromising on one aspect of service in favour of the required improvement on another aspect.

Recommendation

It is recommended that:

(1) Service delivery capacity, that is -

• post establishment;
• establishment of service points/offices;
• facilities;
• resources like books, medicine, equipment; and
• budget

must be aligned with required improvements in -

• quantity;
• quality;
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- level of service;
- efficiency; and
- introduction of new services.

(b) Good costing systems must be developed which will ensure that improvements in one aspect is not achieved at the cost of deterioration in another aspect.

7.4 Identifying the service delivery improvement gap and how to achieve the improvement to bridge the gap

Finding

It was found that Service Delivery Improvement Programmes are simply listings of consultation arrangements, standards, complaints procedures, etc., as required by the “model format for service delivery improvement programme plan” in the White Paper (Appendix B of the White Paper).

Recommendation

To improve the quality, quantity and efficiency level of service, or introduce new services, it is **recommended** that:

(1) Departments indicate exactly how the improvements will be achieved by utilising the eight step process spelled out in the White Paper that includes “identifying the improvement gap” and “gearing up for delivery”.

(2) When new services are being introduced or improvement in efficiency is required, departments must indicate the effect of such initiatives on -

- the need for investing in more resources;
- improving business processes;
- training of staff;
- better resource allocation; and
- better management.

Something must be changed, otherwise nothing will change - it will be business as usual.

7.5 Applying the Batho Pele principles should make a practical difference to the day to day work of front-line personnel

Finding
It was found that the Batho Pele policy has not yet changed the daily tasks of front-line personnel. It is a very practical policy and must not be seen as an add-on to the main business of departments. It is the main business of departments.

**Recommendation**

To improve service delivery in all sectors of the public service, it is recommended that the service offering and/or the business processes producing the service, be redesigned so that applying the Batho Pele principles makes a difference to the daily tasks (making up a business process) of for instance, teachers, nurses, warders, policemen, prosecutors, magistrates and home affairs clerks.

### 7.6 The Batho Pele principles should be integrated into the performance management system of the Department

**Finding**

It was found that performance management systems have not yet been adjusted to establish clear links between a department’s service delivery performance and the individual performance of staff members.

**Recommendation**

It is recommended that:

(1) The performance management systems of departments be adjusted to establish clear links between the service delivery performance of the department and the individual performance of staff members.

(2) Such a performance management system should meet the following requirements:

- A department must be structured in such a manner that responsibility for service delivery performance is clearly allocated.
- A measuring system must be implemented that measures performance against standard.
- Front-line staff must be held accountable for conformity of their output with the standard, as well as middle managers for action plans and use of resources to enable front-line staff to deliver better services and senior managers for the implementation of the policies and strategic and business plans that determine the
service delivery priorities of the department.

- Service delivery must clearly be the main subject on the agenda of regular management review meetings.

- Individual personnel performance evaluation, and suitable rewards, must be based on these same service delivery outputs.
INTRODUCTION
1. Brief

The Commission undertook a survey from October 1999 to February 2000 to evaluate the extent to which departments have implemented the requirements of the White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery - Batho Pele. The full project description as approved by the Commission is attached as Appendix A.

2. Aims of the project

The aims of the project were to -

- evaluate departments with regard to the extent to which they have implemented the White Paper;
- solicit views on constraints/problems experienced by departments in implementing the White Paper;
- obtain baseline information on service delivery issues;
- evaluate service delivery at grass-roots level (at service delivery points) and;
- make recommendations on service delivery improvement.

The aims of the visits to service delivery points were the following:

- Assessing the application of the Batho Pele principles at grass-roots level. The Commission placed high significance on the fact that the Batho Pele policy should make a difference to the everyday dealings of the public with the Public Service. It shouldn’t only change the way departments are managed, but should improve service delivery in general and in particular ensure that the Public Service serves the public and put their interest first. The policy should be owned by the lowest-level field managers in charge of daily service delivery.
- Assessing actual service (apart from compliance with the Batho Pele).
- Assessing service delivery capacity/availability of resources at
service delivery points.

- Assessing facilities at service delivery points.
- Assessing management and other problems experienced at service delivery points.

The visits to service delivery points had the following additional spin-offs:

- Creating an awareness of the Batho Pele policy.
- Sending out the message that accountability will be required in the implementation of the policy.
- Immediate feedback and independent opinion to departments on their service delivery practice.
- Giving service delivery points a sense of importance and opportunity to give input on service delivery improvement initiatives.

3. Departments covered by this report

The following departments were included in the project and are reported on in the different parts of the report:

- Department of Correctional Services
- SA Police Service
- Department of Justice
- Department of Home Affairs
- Provincial Education Departments
- Provincial Health Departments
- The following additional departments of the North West Provincial Administration (because they were identified as pilot departments in the White Paper):
  - Department of Developmental Local Government and Housing
  - Department of Economic Development and Tourism
  - Department of Finance
  - Department of Safety and Security
  - Department of Transport and Civil Aviation
4. Methodology

Information on actual practice was obtained by means of a standard questionnaires (Appendix B) on the principles of the White Paper, completed by the Department and supported by documentary evidence. This was followed-up by an interview with service delivery implementation managers in departments. The actual practice was then compared to the requirements of the principles (or standards) in the White Paper.

The evaluation standard was compliance, and the extent of that compliance, with the policy. This report should therefore be read in conjunction with the White Paper.

For each of the departments included in the survey, a number of service delivery points were also visited in each province. These service delivery points were randomly selected to include communities across the South African spectrum in urban, rural and remote areas.

The sample number and proportion of service points visited are reflected in the following table. A list of the actual service points visited is attached as Appendix C.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEPARTMENT</th>
<th>TYPE OF SERVICE DELIVERY POINTS VISITED</th>
<th>SAMPLE NO</th>
<th>% OF TOTAL</th>
<th>REMARKS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correctional Services</td>
<td>Prisons and community correction offices</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South African Police Services</td>
<td>Police Stations</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>As the findings for all the areas were the same, only five provinces were visited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justice Department</td>
<td>Magistrate’s courts</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>Although the circumstances differ, the nucleus of the findings for all the courts visited in seven provinces were the same. It was therefore decided not to visit the Free State and Eastern Cape Provinces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Affairs</td>
<td>District offices and border posts</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>In the North West only one border post and in the Northern Province only one regional office were visited. Gauteng West and Gauteng East were not visited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Education</td>
<td>Primary and</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>± 0.2%</td>
<td>The service points in the North</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### INTRODUCTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEPARTMENT</th>
<th>TYPE OF SERVICE DELIVERY POINTS VISITED</th>
<th>SAMPLE NO</th>
<th>% OF TOTAL</th>
<th>REMARKS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>secondary schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>West, Gauteng and Northern Province have not been visited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Health</td>
<td>Hospitals and clinics</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
<td>The total number of service points were not available but there are thousands of clinics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West Pilot Departments:</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Only the Department of Developmental Local Government and Housing of the pilot departments implemented the principles. Thirteen questionnaires sent to 53 local authorities in this regard, were received back.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5. Structure of the report

A report will now be given on each department under the following headings:

- Background
- Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle
- Corruption
- Implementat ion at service delivery points
- Good practice examples
- Constraints/problems
- Recommendations

This is a summary report. Separate reports on each department are also available.
PART 1: DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONAL SERVICES (DCS)
1. Background

The aim of the Department of Correctional Services (DCS) is to contribute to maintaining and protecting a just, peaceful and safe society by enforcing sentences of the courts in the manner prescribed by the Correctional Service Act, 1998, detaining all prisoners in safe custody whilst ensuring their human dignity and promoting the social responsibility and human development of all prisoners and persons subject to community corrections.

Services are delivered at two points to the community, which is the client of the DCS: the prisons and the community corrections offices. The prisons are usually either in town or just outside town while the community corrections offices are usually situated in the centre of town near the magistrate’s court.

A total of 43 management areas, 69 prison areas and 35 community corrections offices were visited, representing about 25% of all the service points (about 425) of the Department. This covers male and female prisons, juvenile facilities and community corrections offices. Aspects like prison size, "monster" prisons, medium and maximum facilities, rural areas, small towns, cities and former “homeland” areas were covered in the sample.

There are many services rendered at service points. For the purpose of this survey the team members only inspected the reception areas, the visitors’ waiting facilities and the contact and non-contact visiting facilities at prisons and at the community corrections offices, only on the site of the office, the reception/waiting facilities and the programme presentation facilities.

2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

No official Service Delivery Improvement Programme exists.

2.1 Consultation (Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and
choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be
given a choice about the services that are offered)

No specific departmental policy or strategy exists for consultation on the
level, quality and choice of services. Regular meetings (at headquarters
level) are, however, held with stakeholders of the Department such as -

- the Criminal Justice Cluster (SA Police Services, Department of
Justice and DCS);
- Lawyers for Human Rights (eg accessibility of attorneys to
prisoners);
- Human Rights Commission;
- National Institute for Crime and Reintegration of Offenders (NICRO);
- Trade unions (rights of own personnel in prisons environment); and
- SA Prisoners’ Organisation for Human Rights (SAPOHR).

It was generally found that whilst the departmental strategic plan
specifically identifies the community as DCS’s client, staff on ground level
have a narrower view of their clients. Some acknowledge that the community is their
client, but their actual day-to-
day activities focuses on the prisoner
or probationer/parolee as client. Consultation is mostly done with the
Department of Justice and the SAPS about the handling of prisoners,
probationers and parolees. There is a need to consult with the wider
community and other stakeholders.

2.2 Standards (Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services
they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect)

Service level standards have been set by the Department. This has been
published as a brochure and distributed to all
provincial offices. These standards cover all
the critical aspects of the services to be
rendered by DCS. Customer satisfaction is not measured. No official performance improvement plan exists.

The following general service level standards are applicable in the Department:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVICE</th>
<th>STANDARD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Safe custody</td>
<td>- No outbreaks from prisons will be allowed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- An escape rate of 0% from outside prisons will be allowed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parole supervision</td>
<td>- 30% of the offender population will be accommodated in the system of community corrections.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 80% successful supervision over offenders must be achieved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 50% more absconders will be traced by December 1999.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Monitoring will be effected according to policy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Offenders will have access to sufficient and valid correctional programmes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correctional supervision</td>
<td>- As for parole supervision above.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and training</td>
<td>- Life skills, literacy training, main stream education, occupational skills training, vocational training, entrepreneurial training and instruction in recreation will be provided as prescribed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health and physical care</td>
<td>- Medical support services will be supplied as prescribed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Nutritional services to the agreed standards must be provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The prescribed standards for personal care will be maintained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development and support</td>
<td>- Religious care to all belief groups will be available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Social work services will be available as prescribed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Psychological services will be available as prescribed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re-integration into the community</td>
<td>- All prisoners must be subjected to a pre-release programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Support systems must be in place before prisoners are released/placed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information service</td>
<td>- A 24-hour service will be available to outsiders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Media enquiries about incidents at prisons will be answered in three hours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Research enquiries will be answered in 48 hours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour supply</td>
<td>- 80% of all prisoners should work.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Work opportunities will be created for 80% of all prisoners.

**Industrial products and services**

- The Department must be 60% self-sufficient in its needs.
- The Department must provide in 30% of the needs of other government departments.

Area managers must submit a monthly report, called the “Primary Measurement Report”, to the Provincial Commissioners’ offices. This report is a statistical report on the following topics and shows targets (based on the service level standards set out in the brochure “10 Services of DCS” and the targets agreed to in the performance agreement of the area manager) and actual performance with regard to:

- Escapes.
- Injuries.
- Incorrect parole releases/placing.
- Humane detention (complaints received).
- Development services (education, training and treatment).
- Re-integration into the community.
- Efficient resource management.
- Supervision and control over probationers and parolees in the community.
- Prison labour utilisation.

2.3 **Access** *(All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled)*

Many of the service level standards set targets for access of prisoners to services such as education and training, health care, religious care, social work services and psychological services.

2.4 **Courtesy** *(Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration)*

No standards have been set, but one of the set departmental core values, is the recognition of human dignity.

2.5 **Information** *(Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive)*

DCS has compiled various information brochures such as -

- “The Way Forward” on core values;
- “10 Services of DCS” on the service level standards;
In some management areas talks are held on local radio, usually on own initiative but with the approval of the Provincial Office.

2.6 Openness and transparency  *(Citizens should be told how national departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge)*

No citizens’ reports are published.

2.7 Redress  *(If the promised standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response)*

No official complaints mechanism for customers other than prisoners exists.

Most complaints received are from prisoners. Each section head in a prison keeps a diary of complaints received from the prisoners in his/her section. There are also boxes in each section where prisoners who want to remain anonymous can put their complaints - only the section heads can open the boxes. The complaints must be attended to within seven days. Few complaints are received. They are usually of minor nature, but all complaints are addressed. Major complaints, such as assaults, are referred to the police for investigation. No analysis is done, however, to enable management to address recurring complaints.

DCS has decided to institute a Participative Management Committee in the prisons where the prisoners select a body to investigate complaints and advise management thereon. It was suggested that this led to a decrease in the number of complaints received, but as no statistics were available, it could not be substantiated. It is also not certain whether complainants feel intimidated by these committees, or whether its proximity to the source of complaint influences the number of complaints.

Trends in complaints and the number of complaints are discussed at the monthly provincial management board meetings. However, no analyses of complaints are done to facilitate future management decisions in this regard. Enclosed with DCS’s 1998 Annual Report was a booklet focussing on the transformation plan of the Department for the new millennium.
2.8 Value for money  *(Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money)*

No measurement of value for money has taken place. Measures like staff: prisoner ratios are available. The 1999/2000 budget is based upon unit costs of R 80.82 per prisoner and R 9.54 per parolee/probationer. These are however not true output : input measures since the output of the Department is not prisoners.

Two programmes were being undertaken at the time of the survey. Firstly there is the Asset Procurement and Operating Partnership System (APOPS) which aims to tackle the problem of overcrowded prisons by means of providing correctional facilities to be financed, built, maintained and operated in partnership with the private sector. Two prisons are presently being built by APOPS. The second project is the Prison Operating Partnership (POPS) aimed at operating the new youth centre at Emthonyeni, Bavianspoort.

3. Corruption

The Department has an anti-corruption policy and an office in which both members and the public can report incidents of corruption to be investigated. During 1998, 224 cases of alleged corruption were reported of which 117 were investigated. Investigations into reported cases of corruption are continuing but are not up to date.

The Department’s Act makes provision for an Independent Judicial Inspectorate and an Independent Prison Visitors Scheme headed by a judge. This inspectorate is to oversee the department’s activities in the interest of prisoners (and as it is independent, for the purposes of transparency). However, the Inspecting Judge responsible for this task has retired nearly two years ago and has not been replaced yet. The Independent Prison Visitors will be appointed by the judge to observe prison conditions for every prison, but with the retirement of the judge, very few appointments were made.

4. Implementation at service delivery points

The majority of staff at service points have heard about the Batho Pele
White Paper. Most staff members, however, do not know the service delivery principles of the Batho Pele. At the end of 1998/beginning of 1999 it was required of the various area managers, on initiative of top management, to launch the Batho Pele. Each section manager was given the opportunity to explain his/her functions to the community. These launches were an introduction of the core business of, and the services rendered by the Department. These launches were generally not well attended. It seems that they were the highlight of the implementation of Batho Pele by DCS, but it was also the end of the programme, as it was not really understood by management as an ongoing process.

At most service points it was found that consultation takes place with a variety of stakeholders. This consultation is, however, unstructured and on an ad hoc basis. Discussions are mostly with the SA Police and the Department of Justice on security topics and the reintegration of offenders into the community. Some area managers will also consult with church leaders on religious care for prisoners and with traditional leaders, prisoners’ families and even farmers, on assisting with monitoring the parolees/probationers.

The involvement of the community structures in the execution of correctional services varies drastically depending mostly on the area managers. In the George area, the management involved some of the community members in education. A previous rector of the technical college, for instance, helped with training prisoners in leather work. In other areas some local people helped to teach mathematics, science and other subjects to prisoners. At one prison the community taught prisoners how to make firelighters and the community sold it to finance community welfare projects.

Whilst performance agreements with senior management do exist, a number of managers indicated that their actual performance against these agreements is not discussed with them. The prescribed monthly Primary Measurement Report by area managers is discussed at the monthly provincial management board meetings. Compared to the individually agreed targets for each area, the various area managers estimate that their actual performance fluctuate between 48 and 100 percent, with the general average at 70/80 %.

The new revised prisoner privileges have been communicated to prisoners and are mostly displayed conspicuously in cells and waiting rooms. Language barriers have been alleviated by the appointment or training of multilingual officials.
Attaining the service level standards set by the Department for education and training, health and physical care, as well as development services (religious care, social work services and psychological services) is severely constrained at service points. The strain of overcrowding limits accessibility to libraries, training facilities and even dining halls (a large number of prisons even have no dining halls!). Furthermore, the infrastructure is not adequate for the high number of youths in the prisons and they are forced to share facilities with adults. Awaiting-trial prisoners do not have access to the same facilities as sentenced prisoners. Some of them spend a long time awaiting trial but meanwhile cannot utilise training, labour and recreational facilities. In most smaller prisons education, training and recreational facilities are not available at all.

Some prisons still have outdated visiting rooms. There are thick glass partitions with no intercoms, but only holed wooden walls for communication between visitors and inmates. Most non-contact visiting rooms are, however, fitted with intercoms. On the other hand the waiting facilities for visitors at most prisons are sufficient, but contact rooms with families (especially in rural areas) are either non-existent or inadequate. The prison waiting room facilities in Gauteng, as compared to other provinces, are on the whole of better quality and more user-friendly.

Most heads of prison are willing to assist with visits to inmates after hours in case of emergencies or on compassionate grounds.

The community corrections office, which assists offenders in their reintegration into the community and exercises supervision and control over offenders, is mostly situated in the towns. This is to accommodate the court process of assessments by community corrections officers. However, most offenders do not live in town, but in the surrounding areas. This means the office is far from the communities where the corrections/monitoring, protection of the community and prevention of relapses into crime must take place. This influences the control and supervision of offenders with community-based sentences. It also affects the reporting of parolees and probationers to the offices as they have to
travel long distances to the offices. Usually they cannot afford the transport fares to report as required. To alleviate this problem, some area managers arranged with the SA Police Services to utilise police stations as satellite reporting stations. Similar arrangements were made with traditional leaders/clergymen.

The physical access to some community corrections offices is not user friendly. In Louis Trichardt the office is housed in the Louis Trichardt Clinic Building, with no indication outside or inside the building that the office is situated there. It is furthermore situated on the second floor with no lift or other facilities to accommodate disabled people. It is also unaccessible by public transport. The waiting facilities at most community corrections offices are not up to scratch. At some clients have to wait on benches outside the building and when on the premises, the waiting area is either sparsely furnished or even used as a storeroom.

It was not always easy to find the prisons as no signs exist to indicate the route to the prisons or the community corrections offices. This is actually a problem relating to most of the services provided by government!

Complaints/requests received from inmates are mainly about transfers to venues nearer home, assaults by fellow inmates and confirmation of release dates. These complaints are usually addressed within seven days. Complaints from communities are rare but one that comes up often in poorer areas is that prisoners and probationers doing cleaning jobs take away work opportunities in the community. No analyses are done to enable management to address recurring complaints.

Whilst resources are limited and the correctional infrastructure is inadequate, it was found that in some areas departmental staff are trying their best to render services to the satisfaction of inmates and the community. Voluntary tutors from the community are used to educate inmates. Community corrections components use satellite reporting offices such as police stations to lighten their daily work load.

The following were also found on the standards at service points:

- Escapes from prisons have been contained. Escapes that do occur are mainly when prisoners are utilised.

Two released offenders trained in sheet and metal work are responsible for training locals in a village at Nqamakwe under the Chieftainship of Chief Sobhekwa.

Escapes decreased from 1 244 in 1996 to 459 in 1999.
as labourers on the prison grounds, prison farms and/or in the neighbouring community, such as hospitals, where safekeeping is not as secure as on the prison grounds.

- Development and support services (religious care, social work and psychological services) are provided to inmates. Religious care and social work services are available in most areas, but psychological services are only provided in the bigger centra at 81 of the 223 prisons. All the prisoners referred by the courts (415) and identified suicide risks (545) were attended to. The target for the management of prisoners with emotional problems or mental disturbances was 9 840 for 1999 and 11 584 prisoners were actually treated.

- Education is provided through courses such as ABET, grades 10 + 12 and also voluntary correspondence courses for adults. Occupational skills, vocational and entrepreneurial training, as well as instruction in recreation also take place. During 1999/2000 the total target set for the various education and training courses (the number of certificates issued and school subjects passed) was 13 151 and the actual performance achieved was 14 712. Unfortunately there is a shortage of teachers.

- Due to limited facilities and/or management skills, labour utilisation ranges from about 20 to 60%, with a national average of about 60%. The target is 80%.

- Due to vast areas and bad roads only 72% (against a target of 80%) full supervision of offenders on correctional supervision could be attained.

- About 80% monitoring of parolees was attained due to assistance from outside.

---

At some places even kitchens are used as classrooms.

At one management area the premises were unkempt with the lawn about 20 cm high and the garden overgrown with weeds. The manager complained that there was no work for prisoners, but there were new lawnmowers in the store.

Prisoners who served part of their sentence may be considered for placement on parole under certain conditions. Probationers are offenders who were sentenced to correctional supervision, i.e. they serve their sentence within the community. Both groups are monitored to ensure they adhere to set conditions.
Whilst the communications component has issued a brochure on service level standards, this and other similar brochures are generally not available at service points. Posters with the core values of the Department are displayed in public areas at most prisons.

In order to make correctional services more transparent to the public, authority to approve visits by the public to prisons has been delegated to the heads of prison. In a few provinces, radio talks by area management in the local languages are encouraged in order to promote correctional services to the community. This is important because in a large number of the areas the population has low literacy and never read newspapers, but they do listen to the radio. Information is also spread through participation on public holidays or AIDS-day events.

Name tags are worn to a limited extent despite being prescribed. Various excuses for not wearing them were tendered, mainly change of uniforms.

5. Good practice examples

5.1 Utilisation of police stations as satellite offices

In the Northern Province it was found that, due to the vast areas to be covered, extensive use is made of remote police stations as satellite offices for reporting by parolees. This saves time and travel expense for the parolee AND alleviates the tasks of the already overburdened community corrections officers.

To assist poor and unemployed parolees/probationers who can not afford the transport costs, a few (only about three out of 43 areas visited and then mainly in the Southern Cape) community corrections managers let their officers visit adjoining towns on certain predetermined days each month to allow parolees/probationers to report in. One such area is Oudtshoorn which uses police stations as basis on alternate days in Calitzdorp, Deyseldorp and De Rust.

5.2 Supervision of parolees

At Pietersburg there was a problem with rural families not willing to accept
offenders back into the community if they did not serve their full prison sentence. Arrangements were made with a congregation which baptised some prisoners to take responsibility for the offenders’ supervision/reintegration. The main parole condition was that the parolees must attend church services every Sunday and the priest must report to DCS.

The area management at Vryheid negotiated with the traditional leaders to provide facilities for a community corrections office in their area. Assistance is also provided by the leaders for the supervision of parolees and probationers.

5.3 Drug rehabilitation programme

At the prison in Mosselbay the social worker started a voluntary drug rehabilitation programme with the District Surgeon and Alcoholics Anonymous. Prisoners with drug problems such as dagga, tobacco, alcohol and mandrax addiction can voluntarily undergo tests, a rehabilitation programme and repeat tests. When a clean of drugs certificate is issued to the participant. After release the person may come back for follow up tests. It was found by the social workers that these parolees are more easily integrated back into the community.

5.4 Community care centre

The Knysna management are involved with other departments and NGOs in establishing a community care centre, called Kwanakatola - Place of Peace, in a Xhosa speaking area. This community involvement enhances the visibility and acceptability of the community corrections officers in the community. It is being considered that this community care centre may in future be used as a satellite office for community corrections.

5.5 Information brochure

The management at Barkly West designed their own information brochure to give to visitors. In this way, full information on the visiting hours to sentenced and awaiting-trial prisoners is given and also what the privileges of the different categories of prisoners are. The names and telephone numbers of the relevant managers are also divulged in the brochure. This type of brochure can unfortunately only be of value in areas where the population is literate.

5.6 Management visiting programme
The Provincial Commissioner in the Western Cape has a programme to visit all his management areas systematically throughout the year. Furthermore each of the provincial departmental heads has a schedule to also visit the various areas and report monthly on the visits, problems encountered and corrective steps taken to resolve the problem or improve the situation.

6. Constraints/problems

The main constraints in the delivery of effective and efficient service by the Department are inexperienced managers and their lack of training in applying the principles of the Batho Pele White Paper, poor infrastructure, the overcrowding of prisons and the attention given by management to the community corrections service.

6.1 Inexperienced managers

Inexperience and lack of training of managers in applying the principles of the Batho Pele White Paper cause problems. Managers are not sure how to approach service delivery improvement. They are trained for their task as correctional services officers, but not in improvement of service delivery. They are not service orientated and do not know how to apply the service delivery principles.

6.2 Infrastructure

A large number of the facilities are old. Prisons were previously designed for incarceration and not rehabilitation. In certain prisons there are no dining halls, libraries, education and training facilities, workshops or recreational areas. There is also no office space available for social workers, psychologists and educators. Heads of prison have to use their initiative to provide some of the services they are required to provide.

The visiting facilities are not adequate to handle visitors. Some non-contact rooms are too small to handle the number of visitors. Communication is hampered by the non-existence of audio equipment and even paint blocking the holes in the communication wall between the visitor and the prisoner. In some instances the window between prisoners and visitors is small and so high that visual contact is limited. Most old prisons do not have contact visit facilities. Open areas, offices and passages are used, which is not only problematic for the visitors/prisoners,
but also poses a high security risk for DCS, putting further strain on staff numbers as more supervisory staff are needed. In some offices visits take place while correctional services staff attend to other duties.

Most prisons do not have facilities to cater for a diverse categories of prisoners. First of all, no facilities for awaiting-trial prisoners were provided for. In some prisons there are maximum prisoners, male and female prisoners, juveniles and even children under 16 years old. Heads of prison are required to provide separate facilities for each group. This means that some sections, or even cells, must be earmarked for different groups of prisoners. Prisoners are then held in cells for longer periods since they may not jointly use the facilities such as the recreation area. Libraries and education rooms are also used as cells. More members are used in supervision capacity and due to security reasons working parties cannot be taken out. Not only are members strained, but the forced incarceration frustrates prisoners and complaints and assaults increase.

It was found that labour utilisation is sometimes as low as 15/20% (against a target of 80%). The non-existence of facilities such as farming areas and workshops leads to this. Due to under-staffing, which limits the taking out of working parties, and also the sensitivity to possible escapes, other venues of labour utilisation, such as community projects, are not exploited to their fullest extent.

Recreation facilities are limited in most prisons. The combination of various groups in other prisons where they may exist, also place a strain on their use. Prisoners get frustrated when they just lie about and this leads to complaints and assaults which also place a further burden the already overworked members.

6.3 Overcrowding of prisons

Management indicated that they have to manage with current staffing levels at service points, although the prisons are over-populated. (Establishments are based on the approved population for prisons.) The overpopulation has a negative effect on personnel as the excessive numbers put additional strain on them.

Over the past few years it has become practice to keep awaiting-trial prisoners in the prisons. The SAPS has limited capacity to keep such prisoners and the backlog in investigations and court appearances forced...
DCS to accommodate these prisoners. This had the following effects:

- A great burden is placed on the capacity of DCS and it is forced to release sentenced prisoners early. These parolees must be attended to in the community, which increases the workload of the community corrections officers. Usually no new posts are created for this additional workload.

- DCS cannot train or use the labour of the unsentenced prisoners as they are not “official” inmates of the prisons and do not fall under the Correctional Services Act. This leads to boredom and increases the supervision over prisoners. Incidents of assault under awaiting-trial prisoners are high.

- Administratively these prisoners are also a burden as they have to be processed every time they enter or depart from the prison to the courts. Some cases take up to 18 months to be finalised. Meanwhile the same prisoners are processed regularly, even weekly and daily.

- Overpopulation also places additional pressure on the existing facilities and the morale of the personnel. Maintenance problems are created as the prisons were built for a certain capacity. Facilities such as kitchens and toilets are continuously in need of repair and maintenance.

The infrastructure is not adequate to handle the increasingly high number of youth offenders in the prisons. They are forced to share facilities with adults, which decreases available facilities for the adult population. The Emthoyeni youth centre in Gauteng has just been completed and some juveniles have been transferred there.

6.4 Attention by management to the community correction services

A target set by DCS is that 30% of the offender population will be accommodated in the system of community corrections by December 1999 (presently about 27%). In all the discussions with management it was apparent that the activities of the community corrections offices do not receive the same attention as prisons. This may be partly due to the fact that managers are based at prisons whilst the community corrections office is located away from the prison.

6.5 Lack of IT Technology
Another constraint experienced at the community corrections offices is the lack of information technology. Firstly, it was indicated that in a large number of the offices, officers did not receive adequate training (in some instances none at all) in the operational use of computers. Secondly, in a number of cases the computers were not installed due to lack of cabling or just not connected. Lastly the use of the intra-departmental management information record system on all prisoners, parolees and probationers in South Africa was unknown to the heads of community corrections. This means that all information is not captured on computer in order to keep proper record. It also means that parolees/probationers may be in prison or parole/probation elsewhere in the country while an area’s records show them as absconders who cannot be traced. All these factors inhibits the delivery of an efficient service.

6.6 The organisational design

The organisational design of the Department appears to be top heavy on the management/administrative side. The country has been divided into nine regions as per the provincial political boundaries, but the management areas under the Provincial Commissioners range from seven to forty-one, with an average of twenty-four. This uneven spread of responsibility between provincial commissioners may influence service delivery as the span of control in some provinces are too wide to handle effectively.

Provincial offices have up to 80 staff members controlling different functional tasks of the area managers. This includes functions such as human resources, financial management, logistics, etc. Some of these same tasks are executed by area management, maybe on a smaller scale. Speedy execution of tasks such as maintenance, is hampered by the cumbersome bureaucratic communication lines and unwieldy procedures.

6.7 Staffing ratio

The staffing ratio in the area manager’s office in relation to the line
functions in some areas is of concern. In the Area Management: Riebeeck West, for instance, the total establishment is 66 of which 21 (32%) are in the manager’s office, leaving only two thirds to work in the prison. In addition, some of the members working in the prison also do administrative work such as purchasing, reception, etc, which could be done by the area management which is on the same premises.

There are management areas (such as Barkly West and Riebeeck West) with only one prison and no community corrections office. Such areas could easily be combined with neighbouring areas under one area manager, saving posts for the execution of line functions.

6.8 Lack of addresses

The lack of addresses and the confirmation thereof in informal settlement areas creates problems with the releasing and monitoring of parolees/probationers. This also put additional pressure on the workload of the community corrections officers.

6.9 Reluctance of community to get involved

Due to the high unemployment rate in some areas the community does not want early release of prisoners on parole as the community can not care for them if they are unemployed. The community also do not want probationers as they usually do community work that could have provided an income for an unskilled person. All these factors place an extra burden on community corrections officers trying to win the co-operation of the community. It also keep prisoners in prison who could have been released on parole and as such furthers overcrowding.

6.10 Imposing of sentences

The manner of sentencing by magistrates is also a problem experienced. In some areas the magistrates are not keen on sentencing offenders to correctional supervision. One of the reasons is that they take into consideration the expectation of the community that offenders should go to prison. Other magistrates just do not cooperate in the speedy handling of cases or sentencing to correctional supervision.

6.11 Lack of transport
The availability of sufficient and the right kind of transport, is a further constraint on service delivery by the community corrections offices. They are heavily dependent on transport for monitoring. Some areas are inaccessible due to poor or no roads at all. There is a need for trucks or even a 4X4. Some areas are so bad that the officers must leave their vehicles and walk for long distances.

6.12 Aids

In areas where there is a high incidence of AIDS/HIV, prisoners need special treatment like medicines, extra food and fresh fruit. When the prisoners are released on parole they are unable to get work and, on the other hand, they and their families cannot afford hospital treatment and medicine. In these areas prisons are compelled to keep prisoners suffering from AIDS-related diseases for the full term of their sentences because their families do not want the extra burden on them. This leads to increases in overcrowding putting further strain on facilities. As no special financial arrangements for these extra expenses seem to have been made, they have to be defrayed from the normal budget. This drains finances which should have been used for the provision of other services.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

To implement the Batho Pele successfully and to improve service delivery at grass-roots level on the aspects highlighted in this report, the following recommendations are made:

7.1 Service Delivery Improvement Programme

A Service Delivery Improvement Programme must be drawn up for the Department as a whole and for each functional area.

7.2 Guidelines

(a) Area managers must be provided with guidelines on

- the need for consultation;
- who to consult;
- what the consultation should be about; and
- how the consultation should be conducted.
(b) Guidelines on the methodology for measurement of performance against service standards must be issued to all managers.

(c) The Department of Public Service and Administration must provide departments with Batho Pele implementation guidelines that must be incorporated in training courses for managers.

7.3 Information

To improve information about the services of the DCS, the Department, in collaboration with Provincial Offices, must:

(a) Develop a formal complaints system for clients other than prisoners.

(b) Develop a non-prisoners communication programme utilising the local radio stations for phone-in programmes, giving general information on prisoners’ privileges, visiting hours and the role the community can play in the reintegration of offenders.

(c) Display service level standards, detailing targets and performance, at all service points.

(d) Distribute the brochures on the “10 Services of DCS” and “Services Rendered by the Department of Correctional Services” more rigorously at service delivery points.

(e) Enforce the policy on the wearing of name tags to assist visitors in identifying persons they need to see and, in case of poor service, who to complain about.

7.4 Training

The training programme of the Department should include modules on service improvement.

7.5 Utilisation of community structures

To enhance the monitoring and reintegration of parolees/probationers back into society, the following options need to be better exploited:

(a) The utilisation of community structures.

(b) Officers going to specific venues, such as police stations,
adjoining towns on certain days to assist reporting by parolees/probationers, could also be considered for providing better service.

7.6 The management of the justice system

To regulate the management of court cases

(a) A Justice Management System must be developed in collaboration with the Department of Justice, the Department of Correctional Services and the SA Police Services.

(b) This system must enable managers to trace the reasons and reduce
    - the high incidence of awaiting-trial prisoners;
    - the delays in court appearance;
    - the uncoordinated forward and return journeys to court; and
    - the regular postponement of court cases.

7.7 Youths awaiting trial

The handling of youths awaiting trial should be addressed in conjunction with the Provincial Departments of Welfare and Social Services.

7.8 Utilisation of resources

The Department should investigate the possibility to utilise the abundance of labour in prisons to provide shelters for visitors and make furniture for own use.
PART II: SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE (SAPS)
1. **Background**

The Department consists of ten divisions at national level, nine provincial services and 1 400 police stations around the country.

This report only deals with the findings on the Department’s compliance with the Batho Pele White Paper at national level and the main constraints experienced at service delivery points in implementing the White Paper.

1.1 **Objectives and performance indicators**

The SAPS published the following priorities and objectives with their respective performance indicators for 1999/2000.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVE</th>
<th>NO. OF PERFORMANCE INDICATORS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. To enforce the relevant sections of the Domestic Violence Act.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. To improve multi-disciplinary cooperation to combat crimes against women and children.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. To increase the detection of corruption within the SAPS.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. To limit the opportunity for corruption within the SAPS.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. To conduct visible policing patrols on crime pattern analysis.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. To develop a policy for sector policing.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. To improve the ability to gather pro-active crime intelligence.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. To improve the ability for crime intelligence.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. To improve the quality of service through the Service Delivery Improvement Programme (SDIP) in identified areas. The performance indicators are the following:</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a) Results of Service Delivery Improvement Programme Johannesburg.

(b) Number of police areas where best practices
## OBJECTIVE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>No. of Performance Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(c) Results of relevant public surveys.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. To develop a policy for the optimal utilisation of police reservists.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. To increase the number of investigators.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. To improve the competency of investigators.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. To ensure the optimal utilization of investigators.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. To develop a policy defining the role and responsibility of members in terms of victim support. The performance indicators are the following:</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Issuing of National Instruction.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Number of members trained in victim empowerment.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Number of police stations equipped with facilities for privacy during statement taking.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. To improve programmes to support employees exposed to trauma.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. To cultivate a culture of saving within the SAPS.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. To reduce human and physical resources at National, Provincial and Area Head Offices for distribution to police stations, units or operational components</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. To motivate all employees to live up to the Code of Conduct.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. To enhance management/employee relations by establishing participative management structures.</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. To present programmes/courses that will improve the competencies of all employees.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1.2. Service Delivery Improvement Programme (SDIP)

The SAPS developed a strategy to improve service delivery to communities at local level. The strategic approach followed was to implement a SDIP.
The SDIP is a management tool which thus far was implemented at 700 of the 1 400 police stations in the country. The objective is to have all police stations on the SDIP by the end of 2000.

The methodology includes worksheets to identify problems at every SDIP police station. A station plan is devised through a facilitation process. The plan is then implemented, evaluated and monitored. The SDIP has been designed and developed since 1995. The current programme has culminated from various initiatives to implement community policing and improve service delivery and has evolved into a programme which has at its basis a tested methodology, whereby facilitators are trained in the use of problem solving methodology, the development of integrated station plans based on station profiles, service charters and identified priorities and projects.

A National Instruction (1/2000) which sets out roles and responsibilities has been developed.

A National Project Office has been established to facilitate the implementation of the project with the support of members of The Belgian Gendarmerie (Belgian National Police Service), which also provides funding, skills training and implementation support in terms of a collaboration agreement.

The SAPS focussed on the following regarding implementation:

- The National Instruction on SDIP was issued. It *inter alia* addresses a process of managing the SDIP, functions and responsibilities within the different levels of the SAPS, prescribes a standard methodology and the communication approach. The Instruction also serves as a marketing strategy.

- Facilitators and management of all police stations were trained in the SDIP methodology.

- Operational managers of all police stations were trained in operational planning.

*President Nelson Mandela’s address to Parliament, February 1996.*

*a new patriotism among communities, the public and private sectors and the security forces - so that at the end of each day, each of us can answer in the affirmative the question: ‘Have I done something today to stamp out crime?’*
• The SDIP with initial focus on the identified hot spots / crime zones was implemented.

• A standard evaluation mechanism was developed and implemented.

• A database of best practices was developed and is being maintained and best practices rolled out.

The SAPS expects the programme to achieve the following:

• A management structure (station up to national) which will actively participate in the improvement of service delivery at grass-roots level.

• A standardised programme throughout the SAPS focussed on service delivery at local level.

• Active participation by communities at local level in support of the SAPS.

• Creation of an environment of openness and transparency (Batho Pele principles).

• Improved services to the community, especially with regard to receipt of complaints, attendance to complaints, the investigation of complaints and crime prevention.

• Better working relationship between uniformed personnel and detectives and the implementation of an integrated approach to the combatting of crime.

The objectives of SDIP are as follows:

• To empower station managers with a management tool to improve service delivery.

• To inculcate the culture of participative management at police stations.

• To increase community involvement at station level.

• To enhance skills, knowledge and creativity to deal with internal and external problems.
To facilitate the implementation of the eight principles of the Batho Pele White Paper.

SDIP has had the following impact at stations where it was implemented:

- Absenteeism decreased from 30% to 5%.
- Police station projects increased.
- Eighty percent of SDIP police stations have got comfort rooms for victim support.
- Community Service Centres are more organised and attendance to complaints has improved. This was the direct result of community satisfaction surveys done at Community Service Centres.
- The police stations use worksheets to do directed patrols instead of random patrols.
- Because the methodology focuses on the productivity of each detective, the flow of dockets and clearance rate (cases disposed of as either referred to court, withdrawn or unfounded), have increased.
- An average of 90% of dockets opened at the Community Service Centre are correctly opened.
- The methodology sensitise station management about the utilisation of vehicles, hence vehicle availability at police stations increased.
- The methodology has brought the detectives and the uniformed branch closer to one another as they must solve problems jointly.

1.3. Structure supporting the SDIP

Responsibility for planning, implementation and monitoring of SDIP is that of line management, i.e.

- National Commissioner
PART II: SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE (SAPS)

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION SURVEY OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE BATHO PELE POLICY

33

- Provincial Commissioner
- Area Commissioner
- Station Commissioner

through formal SDIP fora i.e.

- National Steering Committee
- Provincial Steering Committee
- Area Steering Committee

with support from

- Divisional Commissioner: Management Services
- Provincial Head: Management Services
- Area Head: Management Services

and

- National SDIP Co-ordinator
- Provincial SDIP Co-ordinator
- Area SDIP Co-ordinator
- Station SDIP Co-ordinator

NB: The instruction discussed above is included in the performance agreement of the management echelon, i.e. any member appointed at salary level 13 (Director) and higher.

Following therefore are the findings which will be discussed under the following headings:

- Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle
- Corruption
- Good practice examples
- Constraints/problems
- Recommendations

2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

Findings made at police stations regarding the application of the Batho Pele principles are as follows:

2.1 Consultation (Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered)
The police stations consult monthly through the CPFs, which in effect are partnerships between the communities and the various police stations serving them. Partnership policing was developed during the 1980s, when the model of the police as the dominant party in many community policing programmes, evolved into a new concept of independent agents working together in partnership with formal structures. This form of policing conforms to the ideal of a ‘multi-agency approach’ whereby the police, the public, elected officials, government, business and other agencies work together in partnership to address crime and community safety.

Evidence was found that the SAPS is serious in its attempts to gain the confidence and cooperation of the various communities they serve.

2.2 Standards  *(Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect)*

Service standards are not published for customers to see the level and quality of service they can expect. However, the objectives and performance indicators reproduced above, mostly relate directly to service delivery. Surveys are also undertaken by external institutions for the SAPS to determine the degree of public satisfaction with the service rendered by the SAPS. The results of previous surveys conducted nationally provide the baseline against which to measure or evaluate the level of success towards the set objectives. One example of such a survey is Project Protect (a research project conducted by AC Nielsen MRA) during 1998. The main findings of the survey were:

- Sixty four percent (64%) of adults feel very or fairly safe in their neighbourhood at night. Seventeen percent (17%), however, feel very unsafe.
- Thirty seven percent (37%) of adults had less trust in the SAPS compared with the previous year.
- Whilst 99% of the people surveyed were aware of the SAPS, only 51% were aware of CPFs and 59% were aware of private security companies.
- Fifty seven percent of respondents agreed that the SAPS is friendly.
and polite in helping people whilst 31% disagreed and 12% did not know.

- On the statement “There was general satisfaction with the service at police station/charge office (community service centre) in your area since the beginning of 1996”, the response was as follows:
  - Very satisfied 15%.
  - Satisfied 33%.
  - Neither/ Nor 15%.
  - Dissatisfied 11%.
  - Very dissatisfied 11%.

2.3 Access (All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled)

With a few exceptions, due to lack of person power, all police stations are open 24 hours per day for any member of the public and no discrimination is applied regarding race, gender or anything else. The fact that police stations are open does however not necessarily mean that all police officials are accessible to the public. In some instances it is almost impossible for members of the community to obtain services from police stations. This is especially the case in Umtata where, due to the mountains and the absence of roads and telephones, clients have to walk up to thirty kilometres to get to the nearest police station. Due to the layout and the absence of ramps at a large number of police stations, the elderly and disabled cannot gain access easily.

2.4 Courtesy (Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration)

Although nothing about courtesy has been published or displayed at police stations, the station commanders and other senior police officers visit the community service centres regularly to ascertain that the public is served with the necessary courtesy and consideration. A programme is followed which will ensure that eventually all police stations will have trauma rooms for victims of crime where they can be heard in private and be supported by police officials specifically trained for this purpose. Officials are also trained in service delivery which includes training on conduct towards members of the public. Training is also provided in victim empowerment, which includes emotional and practical support, counselling and information regarding the functioning of the Criminal Justice System.

2.5 Information (Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the
Public services they are entitled to receive

Pamphlets, posters and visits to schools and old age homes are among other things used to inform members of the public of services rendered by the SAPS. The local newspapers, radio and television are also utilised in addition to the CPFs. Help lines are available where members of the public can communicate with the police free of charge. Community police officers, station commanders and other police officials are always ready to inform the public on police matters.

2.6 Openness and transparency (Citizens should be told how national departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge)

At some police stations an information directory of all police officials responsible for certain functions is displayed where it is visible for the public. The name of the station commander is displayed at her/his office. Through the CPFs the public are informed on all matters affecting their police station, including the performance of the station. SDIP statistics are as a rule displayed and any member of the public has access thereto. Citizens are, however, not fully informed on the budget of the police station or the SAPS as such. In fact, some of the police stations themselves do not know the size of their budgets, and the vacancies they have.

2.7 Redress (Complaints should be handled sympathetically and positively)

The SAPS has a procedure (standing order) which prescribes how complaints should be handled. In addition, community police officers (CPOs) are appointed at every police station to attend to the concerns of members of the public. At the police stations visited during the investigation, station commanders follow an open door approach and are available during normal office hours for any member of the public for whatever reason. Complaints against members of the SAPS are registered and followed up. These complaints are monitored by all levels of management from station commander to the office of the National Commissioner. During the period 1 July 1999 to 30 September 1999, for instance, 140 formal complaints were received. The main reasons for the complaints and the number of complaints against each reason were as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REASON FOR COMPLAINT</th>
<th>NUMBER OF COMPLAINTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poor communication</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unprofessional service</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Poor investigation | 24  
Corruption          | 7  
Other              | 6  

The complaints were finalised by the Community Service Line and the reaction was as follows:

- Complainant satisfied  
  96  
- Complainant not satisfied  
  2  
- Referred to Service  
  Investigations | 6

The Divisional Commissioner: Management Services, among other things, recommended that “this information should be submitted to all Divisional Commissioners at Head Office for information and to be taken into consideration during visits to police stations as well as for the information and distribution to components such as Research, Training, National Inspectorate, etc. that could utilize it to determine tendencies on a national level and to enable them to set national standards and guidelines through which the quality of service rendering could be improved”.

In addition to this mechanism, there is also the Independent Complaints Directorate which specifically investigates complaints against members of the SAPS. Station commanders also investigate complaints and take disciplinary action where needed.

2.8 Value for money  *(Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money)*

The SAPS, amongst other things, effectively uses reservists who render their services without any remuneration to strengthen the establishment of the police. The members of the CPFs also serve in this capacity without any financial rewards. The number of cases (dockets) finalised by the detectives are closely monitored. The “effective detective” principle is followed where the detective and a police official in uniform visit the scene of a crime together to save on the use of vehicles, reduce the time needed to solve cases and to train members. Vehicles are often donated to police stations by communities. Informers are used to save the police time, cost and effort. The number of visible policing patrols are reported on. So is the number of employees trained in crime analysis. Other performance
indicators which are reported on in this respect are:

- Setting of national standards per identified expenditure item.
- Quarterly assessment report on expenditure against standards.
- Percentage decrease at head offices.
- Number of members redeployed for operational policing duties.
- Number and type of physical resources redeployed for operational policing duties.
- Number of working days per month lost due to employees absent from duty.
- Number of police stations visited by National, Provincial and Area Management.

The Department also has partnerships with the private sector, non-governmental organisations and communities, mainly through the CPFs.

3. Corruption

The Department has a code of conduct which is signed by all officials. There is an anti-corruption unit and performance indicators to measure and fight corruption in the police. Special efforts were also made by some police stations to address corruption. The SAPS has an Anti-Corruption Unit which came into operation on 1 January 1996. It has a national office and satellite offices in the major centres and towns in the country. Several projects were successfully launched to stamp out corruption in the SAPS.

4. Good practice examples

The SDIP methodology is a good management tool that can be utilised fruitfully by other departments. The structure and responsibilities of the various levels responsible for the implementation and maintenance of the system could also serve as guidance for other departments.
The “Policing Priorities and Objectives for 1999/2000" is also a good example of how to state objectives and performance indicators.

The “Practical guide to Local Partnership Policing”, published by the Institute for Security Studies and sponsored by Pick and Pay, contains 50 examples of good practices (projects) which could be copied by other police stations and departments. Some of these projects are:

- How to create awareness.
- Finding shelters for street children.
- Establishing soccer teams for farm labourers to involve them in crime prevention as well as to limit the consumption of alcohol.
- Ways to obtain sponsorships from the business community.
- Involving the SANDF in the training of farmers and workers in self defence.
- A code of conduct for shebeens and taverns.
- Involving children who are often on the streets, playing or walking together, to act as eyes and ears of the police.
- How to establish effective communication channels.
- The cell watch project which utilises the cellular network to assist the police in recovering stolen vehicles.
- Involving domestic workers and gardeners in combatting crime.
- Radio broadcasts targeted at the elderly, farmers, housewives and motorists to make them aware of crime and how to prevent it.
- The training of volunteers to handle community service centre functions. This include filling out dockets and dealing with the payment of fines.
- Business was approached to donate paint, painting equipment and food and drink and the community, together with the police, painted a police station.
- The SAPS and CPF established a choir made up of members of the
community and the SAPS.

- A drama group was formed between community reservists and SAPS members.
- The SAPS and local gang members formed soccer teams on weekends.

5. Constraints/problems

The main constraint in implementing Batho Pele is the lack of human and financial resources. As already indicated, the SAPS overcame these obstacles to a large extent by utilising human resources who are not paid for services rendered and by obtaining finance from the community and from business. Effective service delivery is further hampered by inadequate accommodation. In many instances police cells are not suitable to safeguard prisoners and basic facilities such as clean water in the cells are often absent. A large number of police stations can not be accessed by the elderly and handicapped. Toilets for the handicapped are also often not to be found in police stations. Most community service centres lack facilities for privacy and several do not possess trauma rooms for crime victims.

6. Recommendations

It is recommended that a survey be conducted to establish the needs regarding accommodation in police stations and cells. An effort could possibly be made to obtain funds and/or other donations as well as labour from the communities to upgrade the facilities after consultation with the Department of Public Works.

It is finally recommended that the use of the SDIP methodology by other departments be promoted and encouraged.
PART III: DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
1. Background

The Department consists of 435 magistrate’s offices around the country, which are grouped into 13 clusters and 61 sub-clusters, i.e.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME OF PROVINCE</th>
<th>NO. OF CLUSTERS</th>
<th>NO. OF SUB-CLUSTERS</th>
<th>NO. OF SUB-OFFICES</th>
<th>TOTAL NO. OF OFFICES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EASTERN CAPE</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FREE STATE</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAUTENG</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KWAZULU NATAL</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPUMALANGA</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORTHERN CAPE</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORTHERN PROVINCE</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORTH WEST</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WESTERN CAPE</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>422</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This report only deals with the findings on the Department’s compliance with the Batho Pele White Paper at national level and the main constraints experienced at service delivery points in implementing the White Paper. Separate reports on each province visited are also available.

Following therefore are the findings which will be discussed under the following headings:

- Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle
- Corruption
- Implementation at service delivery points
- Good practice example
- Constraints/problems
- Recommendations

2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

At the time of this investigation the Department’s Service Delivery
Improvement Programme was still in a developmental stage. However, the Department’s application of the principles of the Batho Pele White Paper and the findings made are subsequently discussed.

2.1 Consultation (Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered)

The Department consults on an annual basis with its customers through the NGO consultative forum, to assess what the needs are in respect of new services, current services, level of services and quality/standard of services. Research by the S A Law Commission is regarded as consultation with regard to policy which influences the customer directly. Consultation is done by means of customer surveys, workshops, seminars, research and public hearings to seek, give and share information. People who participate in these consultation exercises include traditional leaders, organised labour, the legal profession, religious leaders, the business community and the rural women’s movement. As a result the Department published a Gender Policy Statement whilst an intention to publish a Customer Service Charter for Court Users (CSCCU) was indicated.

2.2 Standards (Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect)

A CSCCU has been developed that outlines service standards which customers can expect for key services provided at a court. For instance, if a person is charged with a crime he/she can expect to make his/her first appearance before the magistrate within 48 hours or the next available court day. When a criminal matter has been brought to court, the accused can expect the case to be finalised within six months. At the court the customer can expect a court roll which shows the cases to be heard, the designated court rooms, and, where possible, the name of the court personnel assigned to each case. This document still needs to be approved by the executing authority before it can be published, displayed and implemented at service delivery points.

Norms and standards are also available to determine post establishment needs. These norms and standards are also utilised to measure and assess the performance of magistrates, prosecutors and other personnel at magistrate’s offices.

2.3 Access (All citizens should have equal access to the services to which
they are entitled)

No targets have yet been set to improve access to judicial services. Two important Acts, i.e. the Maintenance Act, 1998 and the Domestic Violence Act, 1998 have been implemented at the end of 1999, which increase access to the judicial system. The Maintenance Act makes it easier to trace and hold evaders of maintenance accountable, whilst the Domestic Violence Act provides equal access irrespective of race and gender, as well as a 24-hour service.

2.4 Courtesy  *(Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration)*

Although nothing has been published and displayed at service delivery points yet, courtesy standards have already been developed and taken up in the CSCCU, for example the customer can expect -

- personnel to be helpful and deal with their enquiries and telephone messages promptly, and
- that a sign language interpreter or assistance with the translation of documents into braille or audio cassettes will be provided.

2.5 Information  *(Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive)*

Information on the proceedings in courts is provided through open court days where the public and or schools are invited to visit courts and sometimes attend a mock trial. Pamphlets and posters such as Justice Vision 2000 and maintenance rights, are distributed to magistrate’s offices informing people about their rights and the services they are entitled to. Radio and television broadcasts are also utilised, especially when new services/ initiatives are to be implemented such as the Maintenance Act, Domestic Violence Act and Citizen’s Advice (Information) Desks at courts. The latter has already been implemented at the courts in Durban, Johannesburg and Pretoria.

2.6 Openness and transparency  *(Citizens should be told how national and provincial departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge)*

The Department has done nothing yet in this regard.

2.7 Redress  *(If the promised standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective
remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response)

Although a complaints system have not yet been established, the Department has already dedicated a section in the CSCCU to the handling of complaints. Customers are informed with whom they can raise their complaint(s) when standards are not met and how the department will respond to such complaint(s). If customers are not satisfied with their treatment by a judicial officer, court interpreter, police officer, lawyer and probation or welfare officer, the name of the department, for example the Department of Welfare, and/or institution, for example the Legal Aid Board, where they can lodge their complaint(s) is provided. Customers are furthermore invited to give their views on court services to the Department through the Department’s Help Line (no number provided), Website (no address provided) and regular Customer Opinion Surveys.

2.8 Value for money (Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money)

Figures in this regard are in the process of being consolidated. It was, however, found that court hour figures, to measure the performance of prosecutors, indicated that the quantity of prosecutors’ work have improved without investing additional resources.

The Department also has partnerships with the private sector, NGOs and communities. These partnerships include projects such as business financing new courts and providing training for managers and project management support. Ventures include paralegal involvement in providing legal aid, the implementation of family courts, provision of a help line for abused women and provision of training. The Department often allows NGOs to handle the Department’s donor funded projects or the financial administration and project management thereof.

3. Corruption

The Department does not have a departmental code of conduct. It does however, have an inspectorate which is also utilised for anti-corruption work.

4. Implementation at service delivery points
Except for some magistrate’s offices in urban areas where certain requirements of the Batho Pele, such as an information/complaints desk, waiting room for children and refreshment boxes have been implemented, nothing has been done or implemented in rural areas.

5. Good practice example

The Department’s CSCCU is a good example of providing information on what services a customer can expect when visiting a court.

6. Constraints/problems

The problem areas having a negative impact on magistrate’s offices’ ability to render an efficient and effective service, especially in rural and remote areas, can broadly be classified as constraints emanating from the Department itself and constraints emanating from outside the Department. In both instances these constraints have a very negative impact on the morale of the staff, leaving them depressed and unmotivated.

6.1 Constraints emanating from the Department itself

6.1.1 Policies

As part of the Department’s adherence to the requirements of the Batho Pele White Paper, certain policies were adopted to make courts and the justice system more accessible to the public. These policies, which were designated to improve service to the customer, in actual fact have a negative impact on the ability of the department to render services efficiently and effectively, because the objectives and implementation requirements of these policies are not easy to comply with at grass-roots level. The policies of and the constraints experienced by magistrate’s offices to implement them are briefly discussed below.

*Maintenance Act, 1998*

The new Maintenance Act of 1998 requires that a nine, instead of the previous one page form must now be filled in. To obtain the required
information is time consuming, especially in rural and remote areas where an officer needs to sit down with the complainant to explain exactly what information is needed and assist him/her to complete the form.

Domestic Violence Act, 1998

The Domestic Violence Act, 1998 on the other hand, requires a 24 hour service. In practice that means that magistrates need to make standby arrangements for a

- magistrate;
- prosecutor;
- interpreter;
- clerk of the court; and
- social worker.

In urban areas these requirements can be adhered to quite easily, but in rural areas (towns and small towns) and remote areas (small villages) it becomes problematic. Because of staff shortages (or other internal measures), arrangements are normally made with other courts that are usually faced with exactly the same problems. Other shortcomings are the lack of funds to provide for overtime remuneration (24 hour service) and transport (remote areas and/or long distances). Because of this, the whole intention of improved services can fail.

Separation of administration and judicial functions

Another initiative to make the justice system more impartial to the benefit of the customer, is the separation of the administrative functions performed by magistrates and prosecutors from their judicial functions. The administrative functions now become the responsibility of administrative personnel. Magistrate’s offices, however, require specific measures and guidance from the Department and Regional Offices to implement this policy and this needs to be finalised as soon as possible because of the following:

- The separation of functions is apparently not dealt with in an uniform manner throughout the Department and in the provinces. In larger magistrate’s offices the separation has been or is being implemented, whilst in the rural magistrate’s offices very little is done to empower administrative staff members to deal with those administrative functions and responsibilities which will inevitably be coming their way.
PART III: DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

- Magistrates have raised their concern about the prosecutors’ attitude of carelessness towards court procedures and discipline since the introduction of a more impartial justice system. The effect of this ruling is that magistrates are no longer allowed to reprimand or train prosecutors. The result is that prosecutors tend to turn up late, and come and go as they wish or do not turn up at all.

- This new responsibilities are causing anxiety and stress amongst administrative staff as some magistrates and prosecutors have, without necessarily providing much-needed transitional arrangements and back-up, abdicated their administrative responsibilities. They are of the opinion that it will sooner or later become part and parcel of the duties of the administrative personnel in any case.

- Many administrative staff members have very limited to no exposure to aspects such as financial management (budgeting) and human resource management - former responsibilities of a magistrate. To suddenly expect them now to deal efficiently and effectively with these matters is regarded as unfair. Although training workshops and seminars have been held in some cases, staff members in the rural areas have been unable to attend such sessions because of, _inter alia_, a lack of funds, no relief staff to do the work during their absence, the duration of their absence and poor communication.

- Without knowledge of the full impact of the separation of functions as well as the additional administrative burden brought about by the Domestic Violence Act, 1998, and the Maintenance Act, 1998, the Department and the Regional Offices will hardly be in a position to administratively realign its existing capacity to deal with the additional duties, functions and responsibilities.

*Places of safety for juveniles*

The policy requires that juveniles who have been arrested may not be kept in custody in a police cell, but must be placed either under the supervision and custody of their parents/guardians or be put in a place of safety under the supervision and custody of their parents/guardians or be put in a place of safety. The result is that a juvenile, who can still be rehabilitated, is still on the loose to become a tough criminal.

Nobody, including Cullinan’s Place of safety, wanted to take responsibility for the prostitute’s and alleged thief’s supervision/custody. Consequently the prostitute was put in a single cell. The next day a fax from the Minister was received to release the suspect immediately. The juvenile thief suspect has been released every time when he was caught.
safety until the trial. Implementation of this requirement is very difficult because people, including places of safety, are reluctant to take responsibility for these offenders’ supervision/custody because they have to undertake to bring the child before court and failure to do so, amounts to an offence.

This problem is further exacerbated by the huge shortage of, and overcrowding of existing places of safety throughout the country and the reluctance to assist across provincial borders. Most courts are therefore compelled to resort to police cells, provided juveniles are separated from adults, which is not always possible.

Added to this problem is the lack of sufficient vehicles at the disposal of the police who has to transport these offenders to and from the courts.

Prosecutors vis-à-vis Magistrates

To adhere to the principle of separation between judicial and administrative powers magistrates were taken out of the Public Service. Prosecutors are therefore no longer supervised by the Magistrate, but by the Senior Prosecutor of a province. This has the result that court proceedings are falling into chaos because prosecutors come to office when they please, leave when they want, come to court not fully prepared, put too many cases on the court roll, and at times they do not turn up for cases without even notifying the magistrate in this regard. Even the Senior Prosecutor doesn’t bother to notify magistrates about the unavailability of prosecutors due to meetings or workshops.

Thus the time and money of the accused, the witness(es), the police, the interpreter and the magistrate are wasted. This situation also gives the impression of poor performance on the magistrate’s side, which is incorrect because he/she has no control over the situation.

The impression one gets is that there is an implicit battle between prosecutors and magistrates for supremacy and control over the courts.
This infighting is further exacerbated by the department’s statement in its annual report of 1997/98 - pages 33 and 34, which says that the management of courts are the responsibility of both the prosecutor and the magistrate, i.e.

- “The National Director of Public Prosecutions and the Attorneys-General have also been requested to develop a programme for Senior Public Prosecutors to act as Court Managers”.

- “The aim of this (cluster) system ... headed by chief magistrates ... is to create streamlined, simplified and uniform court management systems applicable throughout”.

This kind of statement and arrangement give cause for conflict - a case of too many cooks spoiling the broth.

6.1.2 Standards

It was found that comprehensive records are being kept regarding cases and court activities. Information on all cases is recorded in a court book which indicates the crime or offence applicable to each case and the verdict, sentence or order. Statistics on the status of court rolls and total court hours are provided on a monthly basis to cluster heads. An annual return for the statistical year July to June is submitted via the Regional Office to the Department. This annual return includes comparative statistics on court activities covering a period of three years.

These comprehensive statistics could be utilised by office heads to develop detailed performance standards according to each court’s circumstances regarding, for instance, criminal and civil work, deferred fines, bail, civil court, small claims court, civil appeals, assessors, child welfare and maintenance cases, prevention of family violence, etc.

However, not all magistrates know -

- for what reason these statistics are required;
- how to utilise court statistics to develop performance standards; or
- how to utilise these statistics to measure/improve their court’s performance.

It was found that norms and standards, which have been in place since 1993/1994, are also available (although only to court inspectors) -
for tasks performed in the cash hall of courts to determine the number of posts needed for these tasks; and

· on court hours needed in criminal proceedings to determine the number of magistrates needed.

To utilise these norms and standards for performance management and to determine establishment needs, it is imperative that magistrates and prosecutors rigorously keep the relevant statistics, which some of them unfortunately fail to do.

Since operational processes and the work content have changed dramatically since 1993/94 it might be necessary to revise these norms and standards to be in pace with new developments and needs for service delivery.

6.1.3 Flow of information

There is a perception that the Department and Regional Offices are dictating and that they are often not aware of the impact of their decisions on magistrate’s offices. The unique circumstances surrounding especially the very small offices, the problems they face and the difficulties experienced as far as the implementation of their decisions are concerned, mostly in the field of financial control and human resource management, are either not comprehended or ignored.

Information and statistics are regularly requested from magistrate’s offices, often at short notice, without informing such offices of the purpose thereof. Feedback on the outcome of efforts in this regard are seldom provided. This may lead to a certain degree of apathy from the side of the magistrate’s offices as they are always the ones to respond without a similar quid pro quo from the Regional Offices when so required.

Requests to the Regional Office and the Department to address problems linked to inter alia insufficient facilities, lacking infrastructure staff shortages, workload, lack of funds, vast distances, relief staff, overtime, leave, and the (coming) separation of the administrative functions from the judicial function performed by

Nkomazi magistrate’s office in Mpumalanga forwarded their need for guide rails, toilet facilities, parking bays and ramps to make the premises more accessible to the disabled to the Department on 15 September 1998. Nothing has been heard of this since.
magistrates and prosecutors, very seldom produce the desired response. The Magistrate’s Offices don’t know who is who and whom to contact when for what service at some of the Regional Offices.

The majority of customers who were prepared to answer a few questions indicated that they have not been provided with any kind of information on what to expect when summoned to appear in court or what services they are entitled to. Nobody accompanied them to court/waiting rooms or gave them clear directions to these rooms.

6.1.4 Human resources

Dedicated personnel is needed to drive the implementation of the White Paper at each office. This becomes quite a tall order at small offices where there is only one staff member to handle all the administrative work.

Compliance with the Batho Pele is further hampered by a lack of personnel skilled in, for example, consultation with customers and management information systems. Reluctance from managers and personnel to get fully involved is also experienced.

Requests from magistrate’s offices to the Regional Office to attend to establishment requests are not responded to. The most common problems are inexperienced and/or an insufficient staff compliment which result in backlogs and poor recommendations about offices’ needs.

Witness fees

A matter of concern raised by offices is the fruitless expenditure with regard to witness fees. Offices are required to pay witness fees to witnesses who have been summoned to appear in court and are present on the day scheduled for the case, regardless of their appearance or not. The problem arises when a case needs to be postponed because the prosecutor(s) -

- did not turn up; or
cdot put too many cases and witnesses for one day on the court roll, mainly due to inexperience.

This results in unnecessary fees (at some places in the Northern Province as high as 35% to 40% of the budgeted amount) being paid out, which eventually leads to overspending and the magistrate, who is responsible for the budget, being accused of misappropriation of funds. There is a need for departmental guidelines to appropriately budget for such fees.

Administrative arrangements necessitate that fees in excess of a specified amount require payment by way of a warrant voucher. Witnesses are often not bank account holders, making the said method of payment ineffective and not at all customer friendly. Bridging these measures often lead to a waste of time and dissatisfaction amongst customers.

Some offices, however, try to restrict witness fee payments by not paying locals or not informing the witness(es) about these fees. They only pay if the witness is subpoenaed to appear in court or when he/she is accompanied by the investigating officer.

Clerical personnel

At some offices large backlogs are caused by an inexperienced and insufficient clerical staff compliment. Offices are consequently not able to keep all the necessary statistics or to render services adequately. At times some offices called in the assistance of the Traffic Department to write summonses for traffic offences and attorneys to write summaries of judgements, normally done by the clerk of the court. Other offices are forced at times to close the civil maintenance section to the public to enable the personnel to attend to the administrative work, i.e. the issuing of summonses and the preparation of warrants for arrests. Complaints from the public are constantly received because of these offices being closed. Another office, because of a shortage in personnel, had to call in the assistance of the Maintenance Forum to do interviews and explain the implication of the new Maintenance Act to customers and to issue summonses in this regard.
Court Inspectors

Court Inspectors are appointed to investigate any aspect at magistrate’s offices that is normally connected with work study investigations. These inspections were previously done by nominated magistrates of outstanding performance and who were familiar with all the functions performed at a magistrate’s office. Norms and standards developed by the Department were utilised to determine establishment needs. With the separation of the magistrates’ administrative and judicial functions, magistrates are no longer utilised for these duties. Court inspectors are now appointed without any legal/work study qualification or judicial/work study experience. This results in poor-quality inspections and recommendations.

Supervision

Magistrate’s offices have difficulty to control staff - they don’t adhere to office hours, don’t want to work overtime or don’t want to do more than one task, for example filing and writing out receipts. The latter is ascribed to the influence of unions.

Procedures, norms and standards were also differently applied in the former homelands and self-governing territories than in South Africa. Since 1994 the procedures, norms and standards applicable in South Africa at that time have been followed. Magistrates at offices situated in the first-mentioned areas are, however, concerned about personnel from these offices who, although trained in the new procedures, refuse to do their job accordingly. When reprimanded or when their supervisors attempt to improve their performance they are accused of victimisation, prejudice and racism.

This attitude not only causes supervision problems but also seriously hampers service delivery in these areas.

Interpreters

Twenty three out of the sixty (38%) magistrate’s offices visited have a shortage of interpreters. In the North West province these posts at some offices have been vacant since 1997. Requests to fill the posts produce nothing. The presence of an interpreter is as important as that of the prosecutor. It is possible to proceed with a case without an interpreter where both the prosecutor and magistrate are in full command of the language of the accused and the witnesses, but in small towns and remote areas this is highly unlikely. The case must then either be postponed till
the services of an interpreter can be obtained, or the case proceeds but with the danger that vital information is lost and parties are prejudiced.

To alleviate the problem, court clerks are utilised, but to the detriment of their administrative duties. A regional office even advised one magistrate, as a temporary measure, to swear-in someone from the street as an interpreter.

The established staffing norm is that there should be an interpreter for each prosecutor on the establishment.

**Relief staff**

The apparent non-availability of relief staff, or the provision of such staff to magistrate’s offices at the very last moment, after requests had been put in well in advance for periods of absence or leave, is a matter about which there is considerable discontent - especially among magistrates and lower administrative staff members. This seriously impacts not only on office and other arrangements, but also on the morale of the staff members as they are often uncertain about the finalisation of their own leave arrangements. A negative disposition towards the Department may very well be reflected by an officer’s service to the community.

6.1.5 **Financial resources**

Initiatives taken by the Department to improve services to the customer are for instance -

- Friendly waiting areas for children with baby changing facilities;
- anatomical dolls for giving evidence;
- closed circuit television;
- trauma counselling for victims of sexual offences;
- citizen’s advice desks;
- help lines; and
- the distribution of pamphlets and posters.

These initiatives can be implemented more readily in urban areas where financial resources are more readily available through donations by business. In remote areas however, offices do not even have enough money to provide in their basic needs such as a tape recorder for court proceedings and a photocopying machine, or to pay out mandatory fees. In these areas it is also more difficult to solicit businesses to donate money to implement these initiatives.
6.1.6 **Equipment**

Magistrate’s offices in rural areas all over the country urgently need the upgrading and/or provision of basic equipment such as the Jutastat software, computers (instead of typewriters) and tape recorders.

*Jutastat software and publications*

This software contains all recent court reports and judgements which are indispensable for magistrates to keep abreast of and ensure consistency in judgements, especially with the vast quantity of new laws promulgated. At this stage the software has only been issued to senior magistrates and certain magistrate’s offices. The magistrates, who all need the software, are in the dark about the criteria applied to be eligible for the software.

At some offices subscriptions to Jutastat has been cancelled since 1 January 1999 by directive from either the Regional Office or Head Office. The magistrate’s offices were just notified that the contract with Jutastat has not been renewed and that no orders to Jutatstat will be accepted. There are offices which have received no updated reports since 1996.

*Typewriters*

In smaller towns and rural areas typing is done on old-fashioned typewriters - not even electric typewriters - which is time consuming and ineffective. Although there are indications that computers will be installed in the very near future, the outdated equipment is impacting negatively on the efficiency of such magistrate’s offices. Some offices do not even have photocopying machines.

*Tape recorders*

In the smaller magistrate’s offices court proceedings are still taken down by hand. This impacts negatively on court efficiency because of the poor quality of these handwritten court records, which at times are almost incomprehensible. The norm for an office to qualify for a tape recorder is 1300 court hours per year. Eligibility for a tape recorder should not be linked to the number of court hours, but rather to the number of courts in operation at a magistrate’s office.
Franking machines

Some offices are still waiting for new post franking machines because the old machines were not Y2K compatible. New post franking machines have already been ordered in November 1999, but none has been delivered by Regional Offices. Special permission to buy stamps then had to be obtained from the Regional Office, which does not respond to these requests.

6.1.7 Travelling

Travelling vast distances, and particularly in provinces such as the Northern Cape and North West, are inherent to the functioning of especially those magistrate’s offices which need to render periodical court services. In order to cut back on subsistence expenses a ruling was made for instance that visits to periodical courts should be day trips only. Due to the long distances and bad dirt road conditions, a round trip to a court takes up to six hours which means that only one court per day could be visited. That in turn leaves the magistrate and prosecutor with only two hours to have a hearing without enough time to prepare cases.

Apart from poor service delivery, this ruling causes an enormous waste of time (impacts on available working hours) and money (drains funds for travelling). Travelling costs are high because in order to be seen as independent magistrates, prosecutors and interpreters have to travel separately.

6.2 Constraints emanating from outside the Department

6.2.1 Department of Transport

The Department of Transport’s “Arrive Alive Campaign” in conjunction with provincial traffic departments resulted in an increase in high traffic fines and traffic court cases especially during the holiday season. Magistrate’s offices most affected by this campaign are those along the main highways to holiday destinations. Some offices experienced an increase in traffic court cases of as high as 50%.
6.2.2 **Sheriff fees**

Magistrates are concerned about the high amounts paid out to sheriffs to serve summonses, especially in places where informal settlements fall within the border of the magisterial district. Because of unreliable addresses only 30% of deliveries are successful. The Sheriff is, however, paid for every visit in the process to find the correct address.

In many instances R 36 600 and more per year is paid out in sheriff fees - enough to pay the salary of a clerk specialising in tracking down correct addresses before handing over the case to the Sheriff.

6.2.3 **Department of Public Works**

The magistrate’s offices depend on the maintenance services rendered by the DPW. The quality and/or lack of these services have a negative impact on the departments’ ability to render effective and efficient services. Matters of concern are the lack of services, supervision of staff and the lack of facilities and infrastructure.

**Lack of services**

In mainly the smaller towns and rural areas the lack of timeous, quality services is often a source of frustration and dissatisfaction. Feedback on requests for structural improvement/maintenance is either never provided or when the services are rendered (months later), it is by incompetent contractors or personnel who perform sub-standard work. Unsolved problems of the aforementioned nature sometimes lead to alternative, often unacceptable, arrangements by magistrate’s offices which impact negatively on either service delivery, departmental personnel or the public. Although there is sympathy for factors such as lack of funds, staff shortages and departmental procedures, they often appear to be mere excuses.

**Supervision of staff**

At some offices problems are experienced with cleaners and general workers employed by the Department of Public Works. These employees fall under the supervision and control of the Department of Public Works.
and not of the magistrate or administrative head of a magistrate’s office. Because of this, personnel tend not to be as dedicated and punctual as would be the case with direct supervision. Requests to the Department of Justice and to the DPW to intervene are often fruitless. As has been the case, these situations often lead to public misconceptions and an appearance of poor management.

Lack of facilities

The facilities available at especially the magistrate’s offices in rural areas often leave much to be desired. In the majority of cases the old buildings lack certain basic necessities or require urgent renovations/upkeep regarding running water, inside toilets, rest/waiting rooms, cells and offices. Magistrate’s offices are important public institutions in any community and when there is a lack of facilities, it jeopardises the stature, impressiveness and professional image of the department.

Processes

According to information obtained at magistrate’s offices the biggest problem with obtaining services from the Department of Public Works lies with the long and uneconomical procedures followed for minor repairs such as fixing toilets, repairing door locks, installing security gates/burglar bars and electrical maintenance. The DPW only obtains quotations from contractors in the city/town where its offices are situated. These quotations are very high or cannot be obtained, because of the distances these contractors need to travel - the travel cost is usually more than the labour and repair costs - which is not value for money. Delays in paying contractors also make them reluctant to quote. Despite these problems, the Department still refuses to let offices obtain quotations from local contractors.
6.2.4 *Government Printing Works*

Magistrates complain that their requests for forms are not carried out or that forms are out of stock.

6.2.5 *Departments of Home Affairs and Welfare*

In small towns the magistrates are confronted by the community about the availability of services previously rendered on an agency basis by magistrate’s offices for the Departments of Home Affairs and Welfare. These services have been transferred to the relevant departments, which now provide these services only in larger centres. This arrangement might be convenient from the Department of Justice’s point of view, but certainly not to the customers in these small towns.

6.2.6 *Police and Correctional Services*

Coordination problems are experienced between magistrate’s offices, Police and Correctional Services. Both the Police and Correctional Services frequently just forget to bring the accused/prisoner to court. The Police do not turn up to give evidence in court and case dockets are not available or not brought to court. Discussions with the relevant parties to solve these problems and to come to an agreement are fruitless.

7. **Recommendations**

To implement the Batho Pele successfully and to improve service delivery at grass roots level on the aspects highlighted in this report the following recommendations are made:

7.1 **Batho Pele White Paper**

The Department in collaboration with Regional Offices and magistrate’s offices must -

(a) draw up a Service Delivery Improvement Programme for each office;
and

(b) arrange workshops with both managers and officials to inform them about the importance of the Batho Pele White Paper and their involvement in the implementation thereof.

7.2 Policy impact

(a) The Department should, before the adoption and the implementation of new policies -

(i) make a cost analysis of each policy’s implementation requirements and how each role-player’s budget will be affected;

(ii) determine what impact each policy will have on the Department’s own capacity and infrastructure as well as that of other departments; and

(iii) develop and provide guidelines to all magistrate’s offices, especially in rural and remote areas, on the implementation of these policies to ensure uniform application once they come into operation.

(b) With regard to the problems presently experienced with regard to the new policies on maintenance and domestic violence, the separation of the judicial and administrative functions of magistrates and prosecutors and the “Arrive Alive Campaign” of the Department of Transport, the Department needs to make an assessment of the capacity needs of magistrate’s offices in rural and remote areas and provide them with the necessary means to execute these policies.

7.3 Places of safety for juveniles

(a) The custody requirements regarding juveniles need to be reconsidered by the Department in consultation with the magistrate’s offices and the Department of Welfare to develop more implementable requirements that will enable all parties to deal with these offenders.

(b) More places of safety need to be built and those currently existing need to be upgraded.
(c) An interim agreement should be negotiated between the Provincial Departments of Welfare and Justice on the utilisation of places of safety across provincial borders.

7.4 Prosecutors vis-à-vis magistrates

The Department needs to -
(a) reconsider its structure of command or alternative coordinating mechanisms, especially regarding magistrates and prosecutors;
(b) do a work study investigation on the organisational structures to bring it in line with its strategies and objectives; and
(c) develop a Code of Conduct to establish an ethos of service and professionalism amongst the various arms of the judiciary.

7.5 Standards

(a) The Department must arrange work sessions with magistrates and prosecutors on how to utilise court statistics to develop their own performance standards.
(b) To determine proper performance standards and establishment needs, the Department must urge magistrates and prosecutors to keep the required statistics rigorously.
(c) To keep pace with changed operational processes and new developments and needs for service delivery at grass-roots level, the 1993/94 norms and standards utilised to determine establishment needs at magistrate’s offices must be revised by the Department.
(d) To solve the problem of the different performance standards that were applicable to personnel from South Africa and the former Bophuthatswana, the Department must ensure that norms and standards be applied the same throughout the Department.
(e) All magistrate’s offices must have access to the Jutatstat computerised system.
(f) The present norm which links the issuing of a tape recorder to the number of court hours per year needs to be reconsidered by the
7.6 Information

(a) The operational processes of the Department, Regional Offices and Magistrate’s Offices, with specific reference to the flow of information and the provision of adequate human and financial resources including equipment, should be streamlined.

(b) A guideline on delegated powers must be developed and distributed to all magistrate’s offices as soon as possible.

(c) An improvement that could be considered is to provide clear road signs to direct the public to magistrate’s offices.

7.7 Human resources

(a) Establishment

The Department, in collaboration with Regional Offices, must embark upon comprehensive organisation and work study investigations to assess the capacity needs at all magistrate’s offices in order to deliver proper services.

(b) Prosecutors

(i) To alleviate the problem of inexperienced prosecutors a compulsory three months apprenticeship (internship) at the end of each academic year should be incorporated in the prosecutors’ study course over and above the present intensive in-service training programme of twelve months.

(ii) A guideline for prosecutors should be developed on how to determine the number of court cases per day and number of witnesses called per court case per day.

(iii) To improve service delivery, the senior prosecutor in a province must, in consultation with the National Director of Public Prosecutions, develop guidelines on relief arrangements for prosecutors.

(c) Court Inspectors
The Department should consider a work study qualification and work study experience as a prerequisite for appointment as Court Inspector.

(d) **Interpreters**

The Regional Offices, which are responsible for the filling of posts, must stick to the norm of one post of Interpreter for one post of Prosecutor.

(e) **Supervision and control**

Work Sessions must be held by the Regional Offices with officials from the previous homelands and self-governing territories, to stress the importance of adherence to new procedures and warn them about the consequences for their career, if they keep on ignoring the policies in this regard. Follow-up inspections must be performed to ensure that the prescribed procedures are followed at all times.

(f) **Job descriptions**

Magistrate’s offices need to develop new job descriptions for all personnel of the establishment, according to the guidelines issued by the Department of Public Service and Administration.

(g) **Training**

The Department must -

(i) provide training in the basic skills (for instance management, information gathering, courtesy) needed to adhere to requirements of the Batho Pele White Paper;

(ii) provide training to officials on the application of new policies before and during implementation; and

(iii) establish the training needs of all personnel regarding financial and human resource management and computer literacy, to enable them to cope with their new administrative responsibilities and the usage of the Jutastat software.

7.8 Budget
To prevent poor service delivery because of budget shortages experienced later in the financial year -

(a) the Department needs to -

(i) prioritise and align their service delivery improvement initiatives with each office’s budget to ensure better deployment of initiatives;

(ii) make a needs assessment of equipment and human resources at all magistrate’s offices; and

(iii) provide clear budget guidelines to magistrate’s offices indicating what kind of expenses will be allowed that falls within the financial strategies of the Department, especially with regard to witness- and sheriff fees,

(b) whilst the Regional Offices and magistrate’s offices alike -

(i) must develop strategic/operational plans in co-ordination with each other with due cognisance of all their obligations and their financial impact;

(ii) must put strategies in place in cases where it is clear that budgets will not meet their needs; and

(iii) must rigorously manage and control their budget.

7.9 Services rendered by other departments

The Public Service Commission must do a business process re-engineering investigation at the Departments of Public Works and Government Printing Works to improve their work processes and solve problems of poor service delivery.

7.10 One-stop service

To accommodate the needs of the previously disadvantaged people in rural (small towns) and remote areas, a one-stop service between the Departments of Justice, Home Affairs and Welfare should be reconsidered.
PART IV: DEPARTMENT OF HOME AFFAIRS
1. Background

The Department completed a Service Delivery Improvement Programme (SDIP) which was announced by the Minister of Home Affairs in April 1998.

The SDIP contains the following standards for processing applications:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KIND OF APPLICATION</th>
<th>STANDARD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Identity documents</td>
<td>2 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Registration of births</td>
<td>1 day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Marriage certificates</td>
<td>same day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Registration of deaths</td>
<td>same day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Temporary ID</td>
<td>on the spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Passports/Travel documents</td>
<td>6 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Emergency passports</td>
<td>1 week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Visas</td>
<td>10 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Permanent residence:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Local applications</td>
<td>8 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Foreign applications</td>
<td>18 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Citizenship</td>
<td>8 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Refugee affairs</td>
<td>3 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Repatriation</td>
<td>1 month</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

2.1 Consultation (Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered)

The only consultation that seems to have taken place in a clearly, co-ordinated fashion was the development of the Migration Policy.

Consultation, apart from that on policy matters, is decentralised to the
regions. Most of the regions visited indicated that they consult with stakeholders such as:

- Amakhosi/traditional leaders
- Local structures
- National and provincial government
- Premiers
- Trade unions

Although some regions regularly consult about the services currently provided, as well as the provision of new basic services to those who lack them, no policies and procedures exist in the Department for conducting consultation. As a result consultation is not being monitored, but is a matter that depends on the management styles of the different managers.

Results of the consultation processes at regional level are not analysed in management reports. Information from such analyses could be used to inform decisions on how the Department’s services could be improved.

2.2 Standards (*Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect*)

The Department has set measurable and precise process standards for most of their services. The standards have been approved by the Minister of Home Affairs. The Department has published and communicated these standards to their potential customers. These standards focus heavily on the shortening of required time frames for the production of outputs (mainly because of public expectations in this regard). All the regions visited complained about not being involved in the development of these standards.

Performance against standards is measured only in the case of the production of ID-books and published once a year in the Department’s Annual Report. Performance in terms of the issuing of temporary residence permits, for which no standard was set, is not measured.

Taking into account that there is more than one role player involved in most of the processes (especially the migration processes), the
Department should develop the standards to further provide for all the steps and role players in the process and not only for the whole process. These standards would be utilised as an internal management tool to ensure that there are no blockages at any point in the system.

The Department intends to determine service excellence levels eventually on a balanced scorecard of time, cost, quality, impact and citizen/client empowerment and satisfaction. The department realises that realistic tools should be developed for the measurement thereof.

2.3 Access *(All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled)*

Although the Department knows the barriers to access to its services and the extent thereof, it has not complied with the requirement of the White Paper to specify and set targets for progressively increasing access to its services for those who have not previously received them.

Some regions will on request render services “at home” to accommodate the old, terminally ill, as well as disabled people.

2.4 Courtesy *(Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration)*

The Department has specified the standards for the way in which customers should be treated. If customers call personally, the Department undertakes:

- That customers will be served by staff who wear or display name badges for identification.

- That in assisting people with applications, staff will:
  - Address people directly and with respect.
  - Act in a friendly and helpful manner.

- To explain the procedures involved and ensure customers’ understanding of the position.

*In some of the offices in the remote areas where there are no safes to keep cash, members of the public have to buy postal orders from the Post Office to pay for the services of the Department. This implies that the re-issue of an ID cost R 13.00 instead of R 5.00 (5.00 fee for the service and R 8.00 commission to the Post Office). This situation occurs in areas where people cannot afford the R 5.00 fee, not to mention the extra R 8.00 commission.*
• To assist customers with special needs in all offices through friendly staff in reception areas.

The performance of staff who deal with customers is regularly monitored by supervisors. (Courtesy is, however, not specifically measured.) Courtesy and customer care are included in all training programmes and additional training is given to all those who deal directly with the public. To promote courtesy among its staff, the Department has held two national courtesy days in the last two years with the support of the Department of Public Service and Administration.

2.5 Information  (*Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive*)

The department has published various brochures that provide full, accurate and up-to-date information about the Department’s services and who is entitled to them. Not all regions visit remote communities on a regular basis to disseminate information.

Although the SDIP was supposed to be distributed to and made available at all offices (whether it be a regional office or a service point) it could not be found at service point level in any of the regions. Copies were found in some district and regional offices.

Some frontline officials wear name tags, whether it is the official one or just a name written on a paper label (sticker).

2.6 Openness and Transparency  (*Citizens should be told how national and provincial departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge*)

The Department does not formally report to citizens, on an annual basis, on improved service delivery, financial savings and increased efficiency. Some of the regions do, however, report to representative groups and even to the provincial legislatures on their performance against standards, resources consumed, staff numbers employed and fees for services. Names and contact numbers for further information are also supplied to the public.

2.7 Redress  (*If the promised standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response*)
Although a commitment is made to respond constructively to complaints and where possible to resolve them on the spot, the Department has no formal complaints handling system or procedures for regularly reviewing complaints in order to identify systemic problems. In some service points notices of telephone numbers for complaints are posted up. Other offices keep a complaints register, but this seems largely to depend on an individual office manager’s style.

As part of its commitment to respond constructively to complaints, the Department introduced a help desk at Head Office. This initiative has not received the necessary resources and support and is currently resourced by only one person.

2.8 Value for money (Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money)

In its SDIP the Department has not identified any areas where efficiency savings will be sought, and the service delivery improvements that will result from achieving savings. The Department has no structured productivity improvement programme. It does not systematically measure productivity or value for money.

Examples of improving service delivery while creating a more cost effective public service are the following:

- Electronic scanning of fingerprints - called the HANIS project. Although very expensive, it will in the long term provide huge savings in fingerprint identification.

- Birth certificate and passport applications via the Internet – this is still in a developmental phase.

- The Vital Registrations Project which is currently running in most of the regions – in co-operation with the Department of Health where health workers are used to register births at hospitals and clinics while also collecting vital information on illnesses, diseases and mortality is a good example where cooperative initiatives between departments can add significant value. Both stake-holders benefit from this initiative.

Initiatives like the above should be recognised for their potential to enable the Department to achieve efficiency savings which can be ploughed back into improved services and should be further investigated.
No initiative to investigate the viability of new service delivery mechanisms could be found. New ways of doing things are introduced on an ad hoc basis by the different regions.

In the Northern Cape the Department has entered into partnership with the provincial government to provide one-stop government service delivery to all people in that “province within a period of six to eight years.” In terms of the outcomes of a client analysis, the following services were identified to be provided at these centres:

- Employment
- Welfare Services
- Health Services
- Housing
- Municipal Services
- Education and Training
- Home Affairs
- Policing
- Licencing
- Transport Services
- Communication Services
- Postal Services
- Revenue Services
- Information Needs
- Agriculture

Three centres have already been established as part of the pilot phase of this project in Galeshewe and Roodepan (near Kimberley) and at Augrabies. Hours for rendering services are determined by the needs of the clients. This implies that the centre in the rural area of Augrabies is just functioning in the afternoons and early evenings.

3. Corruption

As part of the Department’s initiative to prevent and deal with cases of fraud, corruption and the non-compliance with rules and procedures, an Anti-Corruption Unit, Inspection Unit and Internal Audit Unit were established. The sole purpose of the Anti-Corruption Unit is to eradicate corruption. No anti-corruption strategy has however been developed by the Department, though this is one of the functions that the Unit is
supposed to perform. The Unit at present carries out investigations into reported cases which in itself is not enough to realise the purpose. The direct approach followed by the Unit when investigating cases seems to evoke fear (for the Unit) with employees. No system to manage the performance of the Unit could be found. It needs to be mentioned that most of the cases of alleged corruption in the regions are investigated by the Inspection Unit which doesn’t have an exclusive anti-corruption unit but was set up to inspect adherence to applicable procedures.

The Department has developed its own Code of Conduct. Officials in the regions were not familiar with the content of the Code.

4. Implementation at service delivery points

Although the Department was identified as a pilot department for the implementation of the Batho Pele White Paper and an SDIP was developed as a result, it has not been implemented at all offices and service points. When visited, some of the offices in the remote areas have never heard of the programme or of the service standards announced by the Minister in April 1998.

The Department is not monitoring delivery of services against standards and as a result has not been able to publish a report.

5. Good practice examples

The Vital Registrations Project discussed under value for money can also be cited here.

In the Northern Cape, services of the Department are provided at a “one-stop-shop” where other departments’ services are also provided under one roof using the facilities of local government. The rendering of Home Affairs’ services by the Department of Justice in rural areas and in small towns was stopped without proper planning and costing, thus requiring the creation of new facilities for Home Affairs at very huge cost in those areas.

6. Constraints/problems
The main constraints identified in the implementation of the Batho Pele are the following:

5.1 Staffing

Staffing problems exist in those regions where officials (and posts) were inherited from the Department of Justice with the rationalisation of that Department. Prior to 1994 Home Affairs functions were rendered by the Department of Justice on an agency basis. With the rationalisation, the Justice Department claimed all facilities but left the Department with a number of supernumerary officials. At one district office the Department inherited a Director who has to report to the regional representative at Deputy Director level. This created managerial problems.

The allocation of human resources in all regions needs urgent attention - in one instance 3 posts have been allocated to a service point that currently only receives 15 applications per week. Regional Directors are ad idem that the Core Task Statistics System (CTS) that was used up to 1998 to review the allocation of posts to offices in the regions, should be reintroduced. The system is still used to gather information on inter alia number of applications received, time it takes to finish a job and numbers of posts needed to do a specific job. The statistics are, however, no longer used to convince Head Office of the need for a specific number of posts at a specific office.

5.2 Accommodation

In some of the regions there is a lack of proper physical infrastructure, especially at service point level. This problem seems to be prevalent in former homeland areas such as the rural areas of the Eastern Cape.

The interface between the Department and other departments (including the Department of Public Works) on accommodation was also found to be a serious problem. In some areas the Department of Justice is accommodated in a brand new building with electricity while the Department of At Flagstaff in the Eastern Cape, the Department is accommodated in a shack with no electricity, telephone lines, window panes or lock up facilities to safeguard ID documents. At Elliot in the same region, employees work in a shed with no electricity and very little natural light coming in. In the rural areas (even in Mpumalanga) windows are not fitted with burglar proofing. Toilets are not available at all offices or are in many cases not working properly, especially at border posts where water supply seems to be a problem. Officials even have to make use of toilets of nearby churches or other departments or whatever public toilets are available.
Home Affairs uses an outbuilding with no facilities. Where telephone lines are not available, the Department is left to the mercy of other departments to make use of their telephone lines and fax machines.

5.3 IT Equipment

Computers are not provided at all offices. This has an influence on delivery times since information needed to process documents cannot be captured directly. Officials from service points have to travel once a week (in some cases using their own transport at their own cost) to district or regional offices to capture the information.

Dedicated technical support is needed by the regional offices. At some of the offices computers have been out of order since October 1999 and although it has been reported several times, nothing has been done to rectify it. When visiting Lebombo Border Post the computer system had been down for three days, which implies that a backlog of at least 18 000 entries/exits (6 000/day) would have to be captured after hours, once the system is fully functioning.

5.4 Transport

Government vehicles have to be shared by district offices and service points in the Eastern Cape. Since the Head of the District Office also has to use the shared vehicle to visit the service points resorting under him, it is not always available to the service points when they need it to fetch finished documents from the Regional Office once a week.

The lack of sufficient vehicles also impacts directly on service delivery in the remote areas of the Northern Cape. As a result mobile service points are functioning only once a month.

5.5 Commitment and motivation

Commitment among employees was found to vary between the different regions. A direct correlation exist between the commitment and involvement of regional management and the commitment of the rest of the employees. In regions where managers display a “hands-on” approach and visit offices under their control regularly and also involve these offices...
in the management of the region, officials are more committed to service delivery. In the Northern Cape managers are using a rotational system to give more officials the opportunity to manage sections. This system is also used by KwaZulu/Natal to invite non-management officials to the monthly management meetings. Internal transparency is thereby demonstrated.

To motivate personnel towards service excellence in the Northern Province trophies are awarded on a yearly basis for the best office, best employee and best individual improvement. Group dynamic tools and team building exercises are also used to involve everybody in the running of the region.

In the Eastern Cape officials feel neglected since no proper training is provided and the performance of officials is not measured on a regular basis. In some cases personnel have not been assessed since 1994. Communication between the regional office and the district offices and service points in that area is limited.

In some areas outdated procedure manuals (dating back to the early 90's) are still in use because the updated ones have not been passed on to the end users.

5.6 Management

Management of a region was found to be a critical factor in the overall performance of that region. In the regions where management is committed to create and maintain an internal environment conducive to performance, the whole region is likely to excel.

In the Eastern Cape, management or the lack thereof seems to pose one of the region’s biggest problems. Offices are not visited on a regular basis by the region’s management - this was clear from the fact that the region’s management was not familiar with the location of all the offices the investigating team intended to visit.

Communication between the Regional Office and the District Offices and service points under its control is limited. Information received from Head Office does not get forwarded to these offices. The no-involvement of the top management of the region has a ripple effect to the rest of the region.
Since they get very little support from the Regional Representative or Regional Director, heads of district offices are so busy fighting fires in their own district offices that they are not able to manage the service points under their control properly.

Personnel from this area also complained that they never get assessed. On the contrary, because of the commitment of the head of the District Office in Hazyview, Mpumalanga, ten of the seventeen people working at the office, recently got an award of some kind - merit award or notch increment.

Information on training opportunities is also not passed on to offices. This tends to de-motivate personnel since they feel that their developmental needs are neglected. Heads of some offices never report on training - in some regions however, for instance KwaZulu/Natal and the Northern Cape, it is a standing item on the agenda for management meetings. The investigation, however, was not able to establish from the Training Directorate how regional representativeness is ensured in the delivering of their training programmes.

5.7 Environment

The geography of the country has a direct influence on the accessibility of services to all citizens. The rural areas of the Eastern Cape are situated in mountainous terrain. This, together with the poor condition of some of the roads, are an impediment to service delivery. The barrenness of the Northern Cape is the main reason for its sparse population (only 2% of the total population stays in this region) and the even thinner spread towns which has a direct influence on the distribution of offices. To improve accessibility by establishing more permanent service points is not viable because of -

- the relatively small demand for the Department’s services in this area (only 35 applications are received at some points serviced by mobile units once a fortnight, as well as

- the cost of facilities and other resources.

7. Recommendations

As part of its overall Service Delivery Improvement Programme, it is
recommended that the Department attend to the following issues:

- Reviewing personnel requirements and staffing structures in order to realign them with the strategic plan and output requirements.
- Reorientating of inherited staff - to direct their knowledge and energy constructively towards reaching the objectives of the Department. Buy-in from their side will only be ensured by involving them and consulting them about their developmental needs.
- Establishing interdepartmental coordination and cooperation structures and/or systems to ensure the effective and efficient use of scarce resources and costly structures and systems.
- Investigate the viability of alternative service delivery mechanisms/models (including the one-stop-service model) especially in remote and sparsely populated areas.

**Management issues**

- Ensuring that effective appraisal systems, based on sound performance norms, are in place. Good performance/ideas should be recognised and rewarded.
- Establishing effective and ongoing communication between Head Office and the regions and management of regions and all offices in the regions. New policies or updated operational guidelines/directives should be properly communicated to staff countrywide - regional staff should be motivated to comply with and enthusiastically participate in the implementation thereof.
- Ensuring that effective control measures are in place.
- Providing adequate management training, especially for regional and district heads.
- Creating participative management structures and processes with clear reporting lines.
- Fundamental rethink of the establishment and distribution of agencies/offices/units.
- Developing of a strategic management culture within the regions.
• The re-introduction of the Computerised Task Statistics System, or a similar system, will ensure the monitoring of workloads of components and enable the Department to shift staff to components where the biggest workloads are and to redetermine the establishment of a component or reassign work to under-utilised components.

• Establishing interfaces with the business community on customer relations and customer care.

• Investigating ways and means of reducing the amount of paper work and functions that can be outsourced.

Other issues

• Providing adequate security arrangements at service points and ports of entry.

• Upgrading of the Movement Control System and linking of all port control offices to the mainframe to provide for immediate transfer of information.

• Upgrading of facilities, especially at ports of entry - this needs priority attention not only because of the image it creates to visitors, but also because of the safety risks at some entry points at this moment.

• Linking of all offices where services are rendered to the main frame to enable officials to capture information directly on the system (in the Eastern Cape only 14 offices out of 43 have been computerised and in the Northern Province only 11 out of 35). 

To enhance the implementation of Batho Pele

• All heads of offices (up to service point level) should commit themselves to improved service delivery and the principles of Batho Pele.

• Information and training on Batho Pele and its requirements should be provided to all offices.

• Standards should be re-established to provide for all services of the Department and further broken down to provide for the measurement
of the performance of all the different role players in the processes. Regions should be involved in the development of standards.

- Progress should be reported regularly.

- An effective complaints handling system for the whole department should be introduced.

- A regional desk for each region at Head Office should be established to render functional and technical support to the regions.

- Training and development should be an ongoing and sustained, dynamic process of human and functional capacity building, spanning the full spectrum of staff levels. Opportunities for self-development should be created.

- A structured system for conducting consultation with clients and stakeholders should be developed. This will include reporting of results and the analysis thereof.

- A system for the monitoring and evaluation of performance against standards should be put in place.

- A citizen’s report as an instrument for openness and accountability to the public should be published.
PART V: PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENTS OF EDUCATION
1. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

1.1 Consultation  *Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered*

All the schools visited (see Appendix C for list of schools visited) had direct interaction and consultation with their clients. This was done through the School Governing Bodies (SGBs) and directly with other parents not involved in the SGB. Regular meetings were held - formal in urban areas or indabas in rural areas. Parents are kept abreast of actions undertaken at schools.

The biggest constraint in this regard is that not all parents, especially in rural areas, are conversant with the statutory role of SGBs. In some provinces traditional leaders play a very active role in the management of schools and in many cases joint decision making between the school and parents take place.

However, none of the schools specifically consulted on standards or made a commitment to parents about the standards to be achieved.

1.2 Standards  *Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect*

Quantitative standards such as term dates and hours allocated to teaching are determined by the departments and are controlled by the schools by means of attendance registers. However, there is no uniformity in, or standards set for learning plans or progress that should be made during the year - schools follow their own pace.

Despite numerous attempts by the school and the SGB no reaction has been received from the Department.
The quality of teaching within the classroom is controlled by departmental heads who inspect the work of students by means of book control and moderating papers and questionnaires. There is hardly any control over the quality of education by area and circuit managers.

In most of the provinces many teachers in certain areas display an intolerance for any control over their work - either by the school or departments. This has a negative impact on ensuring and determining the quality of education in the classroom.

The benchmarking of schools by the province only takes place by means of the grade 12 results at the end of each year. This in itself is an *ex post facto* evaluation and does not ensure quality throughout the year. The quality of lower grades in secondary and primary schools are not bench marked by the departments, which leaves the principals to make their own assessments in this regard. In fact, no rigorous system of setting standards, measuring performance and comparing schools exists.

1.3 Access (*All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled*)

There is very large disparity in the quality of schools and teaching, so that the objective of equal access to education is not nearly achieved. There is also large variation in the physical infrastructure available to schools. Most of the education departments’ efforts should be directed at upgrading the quality of education in the worst schools.

1.4 Courtesy (*Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration*)

The departments utilise the Code of Conduct for Public Servants and in some schools posters were put up to influence teachers on courteous behaviour.

1.5 Information (*Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive*)

All the schools visited had direct interaction and provided information to their clients regarding the functioning of the schools, funds utilised and progress made during the year. This was done by means of the SGB and directly with other parents not forming part of the SGB. Regular meetings were held; either formal meetings in urban areas or indabas in rural areas. All parents are kept abreast of all actions undertaken at schools by means
of circulars.

1.6 Openness and transparency  (*Citizens should be told how national and provincial departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge*)

Most schools have made a lot of progress and via circulars, annual reports, SGB meetings and indabas, all parents are kept abreast of all actions undertaken. At one school a teacher absconded in May 1999 and was still paid up to November 1999. Despite numerous attempts by the principal there was hardly any action from the Department.

1.7 Redress (*If the promised standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response*)

Although most schools are doing their utmost to handle complaints by parents and through community participation try to address problems, no formal complaint handling mechanism exists. Internal redress - from schools to the various departments - needs serious attention. “Complaints” from schools upwards in the channel are not receiving the necessary attention and schools are left in the dark, especially pertaining to staff matters.

1.8 Value for money  (*Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money*)

No rigorous measurement of value for money takes place. See discussion under standards above.

2. Corruption

The departments do not have departmental codes of conduct to curb corruption. They have, however, done some inspections to curb it.

3. Constraints/problems

The main constraints that play a direct role in the implementation of the Batho Pele White Paper are the following -
3.1 Environment

The environment plays a direct role in the standard of education. Rural areas are not always supplied with telephones or electricity. This seriously hampers communication and the use of educational aids. The poor quality of roads makes access to some schools difficult. The departments started with the re-deployment of teachers in the province and redeployed teachers find it difficult to obtain housing in rural areas. It was also found that schools in rural areas, while being marginalised in terms of infrastructure, also receive little support from the education departments. Books from urban schools, that are in many instances not prescribed anymore, are redistributed to rural schools. This is a great disadvantage for learners in rural areas. Most of the two and three person schools are found in rural areas. Although the number of learners dictates the learner/teacher ratio, the absence of one teacher has a dramatic effect on learners in various grades.

3.2 Resources

At many schools the provision of books and stationary is a serious problem - some books and stationary are only delivered in April of the academic year. Some schools are community-built, consisting of makeshift buildings without any toilets. Overcrowding at some schools seriously hampers the quality of education. In some areas schools are vandalised and security is of great concern.

3.3 Management

Despite being deprived of facilities some schools maintain excellent matric pass rates while others with better facilities have a low pass rate. This can mainly be ascribed to the management of the schools, especially by departmental heads and principals. Schools are fairly well supported by subject advisors and the latter play an important role in ensuring a solid foundation for education. There are, however, problems regarding the role of area and circuit managers who have to assist schools with school management and governance - some schools were hardly visited and no meaningful role was played in assisting education in the classroom. Some circuit managers have a lot (more than 50) of schools that fall under their jurisdiction which, in terms of numbers, makes it hardly possible to play a meaningful role. There is a direct relationship between the schools
performing well and the management style and active participation of principals in the management of the schools. Without visits and assistance in management by circuit managers, the departments cannot ascertain the actual standard of education. Such assistance creates a climate that is conducive to education and ensures commitment from principals and teachers.

The intolerance of some teachers towards any intervention by management on the quality of teaching in class, seriously hampers the aim of education.

Needs with regard to learning material and physical facilities are not always determined at grass-roots level and the departments are not always aware of what is going on at schools in certain areas. The communication between the Department and schools is also not satisfactory - especially regarding the re-deployment of teachers. This creates uncertainty among teachers, which impacts negatively on teaching.

Some schools have made good progress with transformation and have accomplished a lot with few resources. In order to spread such good practises regional workshops can be held to cross-pollinate each other.

The key element to improve education in the classroom is quality. There are ± 196 days available in a year for actual teaching. Of these 196 days, the following 50 days may be lost to active work -

- 5 days at the beginning of the year for registration and drawing up of assignments and timetables;
- 8 days lost to a slow start for each remaining term;
- 10 days lost to examination preparations;
- 22 days writing examinations;
- 4 days for sport; and
- 1 day sick leave.

This leaves a total of 146 days - a short academic period which teachers have available to actually teach. For this reason everything must be done to ensure that teaching is of a high quality. Qualified teachers within a stable, committed and well-managed school and school system are needed. These teachers need to be supported by quality school
management and quality teacher support to provide quality education to learners.

4. Recommendations

With due cognisance of the principles of the Batho Pele White Paper and to enhance education in the provinces the following recommendations are made:

- The departments should strategically realign themselves towards the re-allocation of resources especially to rural schools.
- The departments should streamline all operational processes with specific reference to the flow of information to and from schools and the support of schools by education departments.
- Uniform standards should be set for the execution of quality education at school level. Rigorous performance measurement and comparison of schools (bench marking) should be instituted.
- An organisational investigation and job analyses should be undertaken pertaining to the role of area and circuit managers and capacity should be built in the management of schools.
- An ethos of service delivery and professionalism should be established amongst teachers to obtain commitment to the teaching of learners.
- Regional fora should be established where teachers can share best practices and learn from each other.
- School Governing Bodies should be empowered, especially those in rural areas and previously disadvantaged African schools and farm schools.
- Annual programmes for regular meetings and interaction between schools and parents should be adopted by schools.
1. Background

This section represents an overview of the progress with the implementation of the Batho Pele White Paper. A total of 82 service points were visited, 49 of which were hospitals and 33 clinics nationally (all the provinces). Besides the qualitative approach taken, questionnaires testing patients’ perception of the services were also distributed at service points.

This report follows an integrative approach and does not differentiate between service delivery points and departmental views and policies.

2. Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

2.1 Consultation (Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered)

Consultation, governance and accountability takes place through Hospital Boards and Clinic Committees, where they exist. While the role of Hospital Boards includes ensuring quality, monitoring income and expenditure and participating in strategic decisions, very little evidence of creating the necessary link between customers and the health service providers was found. At some institutions District Development Fora are used as a mechanism that promotes inter-disciplinary and inter-sectoral collaborative teamwork for development. These fora are not necessarily advocated because of the lack of a health focus. The North West Province is the only province which consults directly with communities.

2.2 Standards (Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect)

Several provinces have set standards, most of which are not monitored due to the absence of a monitoring system. In the North West Province, for instance, standards have been set by almost every institution without putting into place monitoring mechanisms. Most standards, however, regard waiting times. While concerns about waiting have legitimacy, the lack of a link between waiting time and the contribution made by the availability and performance of resources (input and process) to waiting time is disturbing. Waiting time cannot be seen as a cause for poor health care but as a symptom of resource management and utilisation. In almost
all the standards found, no mention was made of how causes for long waiting time would be dealt with.

KwaZulu Natal province does not have standards, but particular hospitals participate in an accreditation exercise overseen by a consultancy called the Council for Health Services Accreditation of Southern Africa. Through this system, institutions are able to benchmark themselves against set standards, especially for health facilities, and to monitor progress towards meeting them. The independence of an outside organisation also gives credibility to the evaluation results which are published monthly.

Ad hoc initiatives at selected institutions in the form of patient satisfaction surveys were also found in the provinces. To give a balanced view concerning health services, patients as stakeholders were made part of this exercise through interviews and a quantitative approach using questionnaires to assess their perception of the quality of services.

Of the 1 200 patient questionnaires that were distributed, 357 were received back, representing 29.8%. Of these, 178 were responses from outpatients who formed the basis of the analysis. The outpatient responses rated services rendered as -

- good (43.3%, N=77);
- fair (39.9%, N=71);
- poor (12.9%, N=23); while
- 4.2% (N=7) gave a “no response” answer to this question.

The high percentage of responses rating services as good (43.3%) gives an indication of the level of satisfaction, the quality of services provided, and the survey itself provides the knowledge of where improvements need to be made. Studies of health care satisfaction further indicate that satisfied patients (the majority, 43.3% in this case) comply with treatment and believe that medication will help¹ (Health Services Research Group, 1992).

2.3 Access *All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled*

Access has been improved through the implementation of programmes

providing free health services, like the District Health programmes under which Primary Health Care facilities and Community Health Centres, are set. The building of more clinics and extending working hours have been some of the initiatives embarked upon to increase access. For these health programmes and interventions to succeed, patients need access to particular resources. These include medical and surgical equipment, food, linen, medication, personnel and beds. Inadequate unavailable resources were found to be creating bottlenecks hampering efficient delivery.

2.3.1 Access to health facilities (hospital/clinic)

The introduction of Primary Health Care (PHC) was to facilitate access to health care and promote the “health to all” campaign. This vision has not materialised and gains made during the early phases of the PHC model implementation are being reversed due to a number of problems, including:

Consultation by nurse instead of a doctor

The PHC system promotes nursing as a first entry point into the health care system. Within the PHC system, a patient is seen by a nurse who handles administration, consultation including diagnosis, prescription and issuing of medicine (supermarket approach). Usually no doctor is required except where the nurse feels that there is a need for further referral. This kind of approach is not accepted by some patients.

Nursing has traditionally been associated with caring under the supervision of a physician and the method where no physician is available on site becomes alien to patients who believe in uqhirha (doctor) or ukunyangwa (attended to medically). There is a perception that seeing a nurse when one is ill does not carry as much weight as seeing a doctor.

Lack of visiting doctors

Most clinics do not have community (visiting) doctors at all. In some clinics doctors come on specified days or times, while many clinics rely on the referral system for serious cases requiring a doctor.

Clinic hours

Clinics are open only during certain working hours. This is the case in most provinces. Where 24-hour facilities exist, this has been found not to cater for all categories but to favour mostly maternity patients. Patients who have no confidence in the PHC system get a reason to visit hospitals
after hours claiming that clinics are not operational. In an attempt to deal with provision of services around the clock, some provinces have introduced a “sister-on-call system” which was found to be working well especially in the sparsely populated Northern Cape.

**Hijacking**

High incidence of car hijacking also hinders the delivery of medicines. Drivers of delivery vehicles fear for their lives when deliveries are to be made, particularly in the townships, because of the possibility of being hijacked.

**Clinic buildings are vandalised**

To facilitate access to health care, clinics are built in remote and sometimes isolated areas with no proper security measures. Clinic buildings, particularly those in isolated areas, are continuously vandalised and other resources and equipment stolen by communities.

**Transport availability and the location of facilities**

Most rural clinics do not have the necessary infrastructure like roads, telephones, water and electricity. When infrastructure is inadequate, communication with other referral institutions, refrigeration of medication that need to be kept at low temperatures and equipment in need of cleaning or sterilisation all suffer. Patients prefer to pay transport costs and travel 70 km rather than walk 5 km crossing rivers and climbing mountains only to be referred to hospital because of inadequate resources.

**Referral letters from clinics**

Several hospitals reported turning away patients who visit hospitals without referral letters from the clinics. In some institutions patients reported being turned away by the security personnel on failure to present referral letters and sometimes by administrative personnel for not having hospital fees.

### 2.3.2 Access to medication

Many clinics and some hospitals do not have adequate drug stocks and some clinics don’t have medicines at all. Causes for medicine unavailability and shortage include:
Lack of adequate stock control mechanisms

Medicine and drug expenditure is the largest item on the budget after personnel expenditure and yet proper stock control mechanisms are not in place in most institutions. In some, none are available at all.

The picture is worse when it comes to clinics where thousands of rands worth of drugs are kept without any accounting mechanisms.

In hospitals where some mechanisms are in place (card or/and computer), the rate of accuracy was found to be between 50% and 75% when stock records were compared to physical stock. Pharmacy personnel lack the commitment to astute stock control and it does not form part of the culture in most dispensaries.

Insufficient/short or even no supply of medication for long periods

In the case of some provinces, most central depots or medical supply agents, short supply or do not supply at all what is ordered by the institutions. It was not feasible to ascertain the cause for short supplies and this needs to be investigated further.

Due to financial constraints, provinces have implemented mechanisms of rationing medicine. In KwaZulu Natal, for instance, institutions were asked not to exceed 3 items per script. This could have its own problems in relation to the provision of quality health care. Inability to create a balance between cost containment and quality maximisation, by implication, also includes the recognition that achieving the required financial savings comes at the cost of sacrificing quality of care for individuals or even communities. Concern with drug acquisition costs alone, which is a short term goal, may ignore potentially important issues of quality of outcomes. Shortage or short supply can lead to additional complications, higher costs and even premature deaths.

There are also instances where unavailability of drugs have resulted in
alternate drugs and medicines being issued.

**Utilisation of expired medicine stock**

A number of hospitals keep *expired medicine stock* especially in the wards. The effect might not only include the drug not working but can be potentially dangerous to the patient. All expired products including drugs, need to be clearly and individually labelled as “expired” to avoid use.

**Free health care**

Several other reasons contribute to limited access to drugs, some of which are the nature of *free* health care leading to the perception that medicine can be freely prescribed and patients are allowed to repeat visits until they are cured. Other reasons are: medicine shopping or stock collection and keeping or selling; invasion of clinics by several members of the same family; exhausting the budget prematurely; theft; the Essential Drug List and the quota system.

*“Medicine shopping” or stock collection*

Medicine shopping or stock collection by patients results in the abuse of the free health system. Medicine shopping is apparently common and a way of life in some communities. Medicine stocks, it was reported, is sometimes not just for family consumption but is collected for commercial reasons (selling) as well.

**Drug theft**

Theft of large quantities of medication and break-ins takes place regularly in several hospitals. Pharmacists and hospital management reported theft of medicine amounting to tens of thousands.

---

2 Medicine shopping refers to patients who collect medicines while they are not necessarily ill.
of rands. It is alleged that powerful syndicates operate with pharmacy staff supplying private health care with medicine stolen from public health institutions. An in-depth investigation needs to be undertaken as a matter of urgency.  

*The different Essential Drug Lists (EDLs)*

The EDL is prescribed for PHC and hospitals. Clinic nurses are by law forbidden to prescribe certain schedules of drugs and these can only be prescribed by medical doctors. As a result, PHC patients are forced to go to hospital. Patients who have been discharged from hospitals and referred for repeat medication to clinics, near their places of residence, find it difficult to get drugs prescribed by the hospital because of the limitations on the kind of drugs that clinics can order and prescribe.

*Quotas/number of scripts*

Pharmacists in some institutions claim that there is a prescribed norm for the number of scripts to be issued for each day and therefore any patients who are over this quota cannot be given medicines. However, this particular practice is only applied by certain pharmacists. Where this practice exists, between 200 and 300 patients go home each day without medication while pharmacists are sitting around, chatting and doing nothing.

2.3.3 *Use of quotas and patient booking systems*

Several institutions and clinics in particular put a quota on the number of patients that can be seen by a doctor per visit. This practice obviously hampers patient recovery and can lead to a complete collapse of the PHC system, since patients’ conditions deteriorate while waiting for their turn, sometimes resulting in lengthy, expensive treatment and hospitalisation of people who could have been cured at the first level of health care. Instances where seriously ill patients have been put on a waiting list have been reported with some of them dying before the stipulated appointment dates.

2.3.4 *Access to hospital beds*

Due to overflow of patients some hospital patients end up not having or
being allocated beds. There has been instances where patients end up sleeping on the floors while waiting for other patients to be discharged (many times prematurely). Nurses have reported waiting for doctors to discharge other patients not because they have recovered but to accommodate new more critical patients. Use of overnight facilities is common where deserving patients spend days waiting for beds to be allocated.

Instances where patients remain in hospital after being discharged were also reported. Reasons for this are attributed to transport problems either due to lack of finances or unavailability of, or waiting for relatives.

2.3.5 Access to (clean) hospital linen

Shortages in hospital linen is a national problem. Hospitals reported shortage of linen resulting from:

Theft of linen by staff and patients

Linen theft has been found to be widespread in hospitals. Both staff and patients are culprits when it comes to theft and as a result hundreds of thousands of rands worth of linen is stolen annually and hospitals are unable to keep up financially with the pace of theft (replacement).

Inability to replace condemned linen

When linen is condemned (old and torn), it is not replaced because of financial constraints. Due to this, linen stock levels come down over time and the linen stock situation deteriorates.

Loss of linen or redistribution to other hospitals by the central laundries

Central laundries handle/wash linen for several hospitals and claims that the quantities of linen sent to these laundries do not tally with the returns, have been made. As a result of the linen problems stated, some patients in hospitals do not have access to (clean) linen, leading to:

- Hospitalised patients having to use their own linen voluntarily or on the advice of hospital personnel.
- Male patients using female gowns and nightdresses.
- Patients remaining naked sometimes for days while staff try to find
linen.

- Medical procedures like theatre operations being cancelled or postponed due to shortage of theatre linen.

2.3.6 **Access to clinical personnel and the problem of staff morale**

As a way of curbing spiralling personnel costs, provinces have been forced to impose a blanket moratorium on the filling of posts. The effect has been very negative for health services provision in almost all of the provinces. Critical posts, without which it is impossible to render an acceptable health service, have remained vacant, sometimes for years, while a large number of personnel are allowed to act in positions without the necessary expertise, experience or training. In the case of hospitals, the high number of frozen and vacant posts limits the number of patients that can be attended to and sometimes leads to long queues, especially in the out-patient sections.

Some nurses reported working more than 80 hrs overtime per month, while others work unpaid overtime due to staff shortages and the absenteeism problem.

2.3.7 **Absenteeism, coming late and departing early from work**

Not filling posts has led to overwork, burnout and lowering of morale, especially among nursing personnel, resulting in a high absenteeism rate. Personnel shortages and high absenteeism have prompted hospitals to use agency personnel. Surprisingly, high absenteeism rates were also found to be prevalent in other categories that do not necessarily experience similar staff shortage problems. The general assistant category of staff, for instance, has a high absenteeism rate and several reasons emerged as causes. These include:

- Trade union militancy and management intimidation.

- Lack of training and assistance by institutions with labour relations issues.

*In Mitchell’s Plein, it was reported that there has been instances where 2 out of 9 sisters who are supposed to report for duty come to work (78% absenteeism). Claims by staff of not having taken sick leave (that is due) are normal (entitlement mentality).*
• Inability of the institutions or lack of capacity to discipline. Instances of workers working only 14 days in a month were reported by the Northern Cape.

• Centralisation of discipline and the long time it takes before disciplinary cases are finalised (sometimes years). This creates the impression that management is unable to effect discipline and leads to lawlessness and paralysis.

• Lack of promotional opportunities for general assistant categories of employees.

• Management or supervision deficit, as a result of lack of training and support.

• Lack of commitment to duty. On payday employees leave their workstations as early as 8.30 in the morning and take turns in not reporting for duty after getting their salaries. It was claimed that employees normally disappear from places of work and go to shebeens during working hours.

2.3.8 Access to medical records and administration

Most patient records are kept manually. Filing systems leaves much to be desired. Patients are unable to access or get their files due to misfiling or theft of medical records (especially of Motor Vehicle Accident files by persons working with or lawyers or by lawyers themselves). Also found were instances where patients took their files to avoid paying hospital fees on their subsequent hospital visits.

Lack of discipline and indifference to duty was reported to be another cause for patient delay at the administration counters. Among the patients surveyed 26.4% (N=47) felt that the inefficiency of administration was a cause of delays while 28.1% (N=50) felt it was not administration that was causing delays.

2.3.9 Medical/surgical equipment problem

In Qunu Clinic, the head of the clinic reported for duty at 09:30 and the rest of the clinic followed. The last staff member came to work at around 10:00.

In Khayelitsha patients reported being asked by clerks to look for their own files. The clerks did not deny this when confronted.
Institutions were found to have insufficient, none or malfunctioning equipment. The unavailability and poor condition of medical and surgical equipment and instruments were found to be restricting patient access to timeous medical procedures. Claims that deaths have occurred as a result have been made. In some clinics, nursing personnel resorted to buying their own equipment from money donated by staff. Reasons for such equipment shortages submitted included:

- Equipment is old and difficult to repair.
- Equipment sent for repairs was not returned timeously due to:
  - unavailability of spare parts as a result of the age of equipment; and
  - payments not made timeously by finance sections.
- Lack of funds to purchase or replace condemned equipment.
- Cancellation or inexistence of service contracts for equipment.
- Centralisation of equipment procurement procedures. Most provinces centralise the purchasing of equipment. This practice frustrates institutions that are users while at the provincial level equipment purchasing and distribution are prioritised differently.

As a result of shortages hospitals have resorted to the expensive use of private sector equipment.

2.3.10 Physical nature of facilities

Several institutions were found not to be in a position to provide health care due to the dilapidated nature of the buildings and yards. Ablution facilities leave much to be desired while some buildings have broken windows and collapsing ceilings. Claims of financial restrictions have also been made in instances where hospital and clinic yards are overgrown with grass.

2.4 Courtesy (Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration)

While some provinces did have courtesy standards, others relied on the patient charter as a behavioural guide. These are, however, not measured in any of the instances. Two provinces, North West (almost all service...
points visited) and Gauteng (one service point in Gauteng), had their courtesy standards displayed.

Problems of low morale and overwork were claimed to have led to the deterioration of the quality of care. This is surprisingly against the findings of the survey which indicated high patient satisfaction with the attitude of nurses with 66.9% (N= 77) good, 23% (N=41) fair and 6.7%(N=7) poor while 3.4% (N=6) did not respond. It must be mentioned that most nurses are very sensitive to criticism and the interviews revealed that patients are reluctant to objectively criticise the system in front of nursing staff.

2.5 Information (Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive)

The culture of giving information seems not to have been inculcated. Information flow and communication mechanisms within and between institutions and the communities served do not exist. Reliance on Hospital Boards and Clinic Committees and making use of the media are seen as sufficient for information dissemination.

Health education material supplied by the National Department of Health and drug companies is widely distributed and available, especially in clinics.

Two hospitals (Leratong and Goldfields) in Gauteng and the Free State respectively, give assistance with information either through a help desk or having personnel specifically dealing with assisting patients and the public.

2.6 Openness and transparency (Citizens should be told how national and provincial departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge)

Except for the North West (which publishes Citizen’s Reports), no province nor institution was found to be open and transparent to the point of publishing citizens’ reports as required by the Batho Pele policy.

2.7 Redress (If the promised standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response)

---

3 Leratong has personnel directing patients to the appropriate section at the entrance while Goldfields in the FS has a help desk and a board displaying all admitted patients and wards.
Redress mechanisms are reactive and *ad hoc*. By this is meant responding to complaints when they are lodged with the institution. However, institutions were unable to show records of and responses to complaints. In most instances no contact information for addressing complaints is provided. Patients with complaints are expected to look for somebody to assist them with their particular complaints or concerns. Information on where to complain has only been displayed in the North West and Gauteng provinces. For particular reasons patients themselves are very reluctant for particular reasons to complain.

Firstly, the method of using patients to evaluate the quality of service has been found to be lacking in some respects, particularly when one looks at the nature of the patient/health-care worker relationship, the perceived role of the patient seeking assistance and the intimidation, harassment and *bossy* attitude of hospital personnel. Secondly, patients, especially black ones, are used to low standards and to use Prof. Huddle’s words, “poor people generally are a fairly silent majority” and therefore the patient survey results can be seen not to be a completely objective view.

2.8 Value for money  *(Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money)*

Most provinces have health statistics indicating cost per bed per day, cost per patient visit per day etc. While some provinces also calculate or have ratios indicating number of staff per 1 000 patients, no evidence was found that this information is being used as a planning tool.

While some institutions reported lack of financial management skills as constraints, others apply innovative means of monitoring resource usage and necessity, cost containment and accompanying unit costs. These include Finance Committees that approve expenditure and the introduction of costs centres, with each cost centre responsible and accountable for expenditure. Few have, due to shrinkage and theft in the pharmacies, introduced computerised pharmacy systems.

---

4 The other province is Gauteng, though only one Hospital was found to have a complaints book, Leratong. One cannot deduce from this that this is the norm in Gauteng. This hospital stands out.


3. **Good practice example**

- The Western Cape allows institutions to look for donors to deal with resource scarcity, but this is not the case with most provinces that prefer centralising donations. Through this practice hospitals, like Tygerberg, have been able to get equipment from the private sector.

- A system of dealing with the PHC prescriptions problem: under this system PHC patients’ scripts are filled by the hospital in cooperation with the clinics and dispatched, without patients having to be admitted to the hospital.

- Most provinces have a problem with redeployment of staff while in some regions of KZN, when there is a need, temporary redeployment of staff to institutions where they are needed most (outbreak of malaria in the Eshowe Area) is used to deal with crisis situations.

- An excellent computerised pharmacy stock control management system was implemented in KZN. Within this system, automatic ordering of medicine is done by the computer when particular medicine stock levels have been reached.

- The use of cost centres and institution based finance committees to control expenditure.

- Independent accreditation of hospitals in KZN has led to competition between and within hospitals. This has been found to be a good benchmarking of the services system.

- The outreach programme where community doctors are flown to different districts in the Northern Cape.

- Northern Cape’s Public-Private Partnership where hospitals allocate certain beds to private patients thus bringing in extra revenue for the province.

- Gauteng has one good example of Batho Pele implementation (Leratong Hospital): the patient focus system that monitors bottlenecks in the system and is able to identify where they occur. This is done through a monitoring form given to a patient upon arrival and collected when they leave.
4. Constraints/problems

Generally there is a patchwork of efforts to improve healthcare quality and many gaps exist. The historical legacy of limited resources has had a negative impact on the accessibility and quality of health services for most. Constraints and lack of understanding and support from senior management level have made it difficult, if not impossible, to implement Batho Pele.

Service Delivery Improvement Programmes have also been hampered by ever increasing personnel expenditure. Increases in personnel expenditure, especially leg and rank promotions, overextend provinces’ budgets resulting in a steep decline of financial allocation for non-personnel functions.

Disparities existing between rural and urban facilities, as well as between former homeland and RSA facilities in terms of resource allocation, physical state of facilities, management and discipline, were observed and later confirmed.

One of the major findings was that at the political level there is a clear commitment to implement Batho Pele. In certain instances implementation has not gone beyond political commitment and public launches to practical grassroots implementation.

Major constraints were found to be:

- Inadequate financial resources.
- Lack of confidence in the PHC system leading to hospital overcrowding.
- Lack or shortage of medication.
- Staff shortages due to the inability to fill posts.
- Low morale, high rate of absenteeism, negative attitude and lack of commitment to duty.
- Shortage of equipment.
· None or inadequate linen supply.
· Poor record keeping.
· High incidence of trauma patients (gunshot wounds and motor vehicle accidents).
· Departments having too many employees (lower categories) on sheltered employment (elderly and sickly).
· Delivery-vehicle hijacking.
· Vandalising of clinics.
· Lack of training and management skills.
· Uneven distribution of resources (between former white and former black institutions, rural and urban).

5. Recommendations

While the beginning of every public policy initiative is policy making, lack of monitoring and evaluation of the implementation mechanisms of policy seem to be a major problem. Not all the Provinces have implemented Batho Pele but several good management practices that conform to the Batho Pele principles were found to be in place. *It is recommended that:*

· Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms be part of implementation and that dedicated personnel or components be given this responsibility.
· Where it is required or necessary, training needs to be provided.
· Provinces consider Public-Private Partnerships or other alternatives in respect of non core aspects such as equipment, linen, food and cleaning services. In the case of equipment, pooling together regional or even district resources can alleviate the uneven distribution of resources.
· The quota system used by doctors and pharmacists in clinics be evaluated more closely.
· Different levels of health care services should be linked through cross membership of hospital boards (e.g. people from the primary level serving on boards of secondary level hospitals) to facilitate dealing with referral and other problems experienced by one level and frustrating another.

· Hospital governance structures be linked to the broader development fora in the area to make it responsive to the real needs in the community.

· Absenteeism in health institutions be assessed and a project specifically directed at this problem be undertaken.

· Some mechanism to deal with the problem related to prescription of scheduled medication by professional nursing staff should be developed.

· Departments and institutions view complaints as a source of learning for the organisation, rather than criticism. Complaints mechanisms, which should include recording and analysis of complaints, should therefore be designed and implemented.

· Provincial Departments should investigate the implementation of a patient monitoring system to track and deal with the problem of “medicine shopping”.

· Medicine theft needs to be investigated as a matter of urgency.

· The linen problem needs to be attended to either through outsourcing or systems redesign. The appropriate method for dealing with the linen problem requires investigation.

· Methods for dealing with staff shortages in a planned manner that will not lead to a disruption of services must be developed urgently.

· Equipment monitoring and their proper functioning must be made a function allocated to particular individuals.
PART VII: BATHO PELE PILOT DEPARTMENTS OF THE NORTH WEST PROVINCIAL ADMINISTRATION
1. Department of Developmental Local Government and Housing

The Department has started to develop a Service Delivery Improvement Programme as outlined in the Batho Pele White Paper. In the absence of consultation with the customer it is, however, clear that the plan will not focus on what is important to the customer.

1.1 Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

1.1.1 Consultation (Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered)

Although the Department at the time of the investigation, has not yet consulted its customers about the level, quality and choice of public services which they could expect, it had started with a process of consulting its customers. This process entailed:

- Holding workshops for all employees on the Batho Pele principles.
- Discussing the short, medium and long-term implications of the project.
- Emphasising and defining roles of managers, the Departmental Transformation Units (DTU), the MEC and the other change agents.
- Developing institutional support [DTU and Performance Management System (PMS) coordinators].
- The process also included discussions with five municipalities to pilot Batho Pele in their municipalities.
- Discussions were held with the North West Local Government Association (NORWELOGA) on the approach to be followed to consult with Local Authorities about the level, quality and choice of services they could expect from the Department.

1.1.2 Standards (Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect)

Standards have been set for aspects of its service as listed in the table below. The standards do not cover the essence of the service of the
PART VII: BATHO PELE PILOT DEPARTMENTS OF THE NORTH WEST PROVINCIAL ADMINISTRATION

Department. It is clear that the standards have not been set after consultation with customers, since the standards do not reflect what is important to the customer. Customers are, for instance, not only interested in response times for correspondence but also in the purpose and outcome of the correspondence.

An incremental approach has been followed to determine standards that did not concentrate on hard-core business. The first step was to set standards for the efficiency of processes (correspondence, telephones, friendliness towards customers etc). The process will only be redirected in a later stage to content issues which include the Department’s performance against its vision, mission and key strategic objectives.

Local authorities were surveyed to get an indication of their experience of the department’s service delivery. Their responses are indicated in column three of the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVICES</th>
<th>STANDARDS</th>
<th>LOCAL AUTHORITIES’ RESPONSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Interaction with customers i.e. service providers, local authorities, the public etc. | Provide customers with definite contact information, i.e. who does what, and telephone numbers (departmental directory).  
Keep to appointments as scheduled. Provide apology or explanation when appointments have not been adhered to. | The Department did well to provide Local Authorities with definite contact information (departmental directory).  
The Department does not keep to scheduled appointments and does not provide an apology or explanation for the rescheduling thereof. |
| Correspondence                                             | Respond within five working days and acknowledge receipt within two days. Indicate when exactly the actual response is following. | Acknowledgements and timely handling of quality responses are not satisfactory. |
| Requests from clients i.e. claims, requests for MEC’s or Senior officials’ intervention. | Expedite the response time, give emergency requests the attention they deserve, otherwise respond to all other requests within a week. | Acknowledgements and timely handling of quality responses are not satisfactory. |
| Telephone                                                  | Pick up a phone immediately, not more than four rings. Alternatively organise for diversion of calls to alternative person who can help. | Telephone calls (diversion of calls) are handled averagely. |
| Information week/desk radio talk show (for housing)        | Four days a month radio talk and information week at least once a month | The performance regarding communication or radio talk show (housing) is unsatisfactory.  
The Department has indicated |
1.1.3 **Access** *(All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled)*

The Department does the following to increase access to its services:

- The senior management is prepared to attend to customer issues after hours.

- In emergency situations middle and junior management will be requested to solve problems of customers at the location where they occur.

- Tswana, English and Afrikaans speaking personnel are available to serve customers in the language of their preference.

- Rural clients are visited regularly.

- A programme is in place to visit rural areas on predetermined dates.

No measurable targets have been specified to increase access to services.

1.1.4 **Courtesy** *(Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration)*
No departmental courtesy charter in place.

1.1.5 Information \(\text{(Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive)}\)

A departmental directory which includes the names of the MEC and departmental officials and their telephone numbers, as well as the services they provide, has been published. There is, however, a need for review of the information dissemination strategy. Local Authorities surveyed have suggested specific information dissemination mechanisms (information packs with new legislation, forums and workshops).

To illustrate the customer’s need for relevant information, the questions received from a Local Authority on the housing budget of the Department have been included in the following list (the Batho Pele principles are interlinked and therefore standards should be set to provide the said information to Local Authorities).

1. What was the amount budgeted for low cost housing in the financial year 1999/2000?

2. Provide the actual amount of the budgeted amount on low cost housing for the financial year 1999/2000 which has been spend?

3. To which Councils did the North West Province allocate and reallocate the budget amount?

4. On what basis was the need analysis done to determine where the need for low cost housing was the biggest?

5. What happen with the budgeted amounts for previous financial years which have not been spend on low cost housing?

6. What were the reasons why the budgeted amounts for low cost housing have not been spend during the relevant financial years?

7. Is the North West Province also involved with certain low cost housing projects?

8. Identify the mechanisms which were in place to enhance low cost housing.

1.1.6 Openness and transparency \(\text{(Citizens should be told how national and} \)
provincial departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge).

A citizens report was not published.

1.1.7 Redress  *If the promised standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response*

No formal complaints handling system has been established.

1.1.8 Value for money  *(Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money)*

No information is available on how value for money will be increased.

1.2 Recommendation

It is *recommended* that the Department consult with customers and develop a Service Delivery Improvement Programme complying with all the requirements of the Batho Pele White Paper. The Office of the Commission could assist the Department in this regard.

2. Department of Economic Development and Tourism

The Department has not yet implemented the Batho Pele White Paper. The component Economic Development of the new Department of Economic Development and Tourism was part of the Department of Finance and Economic Affairs (Batho Pele pilot department). The new Department was only established on 1 August 1999. The acting Head for Economic Development has indicated that it will serve no purpose to conduct an evaluation on the progress achieved with the implementation of the requirements of the Batho Pele White Paper by the component Economic Development, because the service standards of the said component were submitted in 1997 but never published. One of the first tasks to embark upon is to revisit the service standards of all the components of the new Department.

3. Department of Finance
The Department has developed and implemented an SDIP with effect from 1 December 1999. However, the plan is largely ambitious. Practical details still need to be worked out.

3.1 Evaluation under each Batho Pele principle

3.1.1 Consultation  (Citizens should be consulted about the level, quality and choice of public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the services that are offered)

The Department did not consult its customers about the level, quality and choice of public services which they could expect. The point of departure was that all staff in the Department should know exactly who their customers are and should be working to explicit standards in delivering the service for which they are responsible.

3.1.2 Standards  (Citizens should be told what level and quality of public services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect)

External and internal service standards were set and published in October 1998 with the introduction of the SDIP. Time limits were incorporated in these standards but the level and quality of the service are not specified. It is envisaged by the SDIP that a computerised system will generate a monthly report for the Departmental Management Committee. By means of this system the Department hopes to ensure that:

- service standards exist in every Directorate;
- performance is measured constantly;
- the measures are visibly displayed; and
- targets and performance continuously improve.

3.1.3 Access  (All citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled)

The Department did not set targets for increasing access to its services.

3.1.4 Courtesy  (Citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration)

No Courtesy Charter is in place in which courtesy standards are specified. A few courtesy standards were incorporated in its external and internal service standards.
3.1.5 Information  *(Citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive)*

The Department has published various documents (People’s News, Batho Pele Posters and departmental cell phone number for complaints). A departmental directory has also been compiled in which the Information Technology service delivery points were identified.

3.1.6 Openness and transparency  *(Citizens should be told how national and provincial departments are run, how much they cost and who is in charge)*

The Department did not publish a citizens report as outlined in the Batho Pele White Paper.

3.1.7 Redress  *(If the promised standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response)*

A centralised complaints system has been developed by the Department to comply with the Batho Pele requirements. At this stage the Department is in the process of implementing the system.

3.1.8 Value for money  *(Public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the best possible value for money)*

No information is available on how the Department will increase value for money.

4. Department of Safety and Security

In terms of Section 206(3) of the Constitution each province is entitled -

- to monitor police conduct;
- to oversee the effectiveness and efficiency of the police service, including receiving reports on the police service;
- to promote good relations between the police and community;
- to assess the effectiveness of visible policing; and
- to liaise with the Cabinet member responsible for policing in respect of crime and policing in the province.
The Provincial Secretariat for Safety and Security gives execution to the said functions in the North West Province.

During the evaluation of the Department, it became clear that the Secretariat interpreted the implementation of Batho Pele as applying to services of the South African Police Service in the North West Province. No Service Delivery Improvement Programme for their own services has been developed.

The Commission made the following clear to the Head of Department:

The national Department of Safety and Security (the SA Police Service) and the provincial Department of Safety and Security have been separately listed in the Public Service Act. These departments are independent institutions which render distinctive services to their customers.

Each department, including the Provincial Secretariat for Safety and Security, has its own unique services. As such, each department should add value to the total package of services rendered by government. If this is not the case with regard to a particular department, that department could be abolished.

Consequently, each department should apply Batho Pele to its own clients and its own unique services.

It is therefore clear from the above explanation that the provincial Department of Safety and Security (Provincial Secretariat for Safety and Security) of the North West Province should develop its own departmental service delivery improvement programme. The South African Police Service is only one of the customers of the Department.

5. Department of Transport and Civil Aviation

No evaluation has been done on the progress achieved with the implementation of the requirements of the Batho Pele White Paper. According to the acting Director Human Resource Management, a lack of enthusiasm of the appointed managers to drive the said programme forward, is the reason why they did not make any progress. The acting Head of Transport and Civil Aviation has also agreed that no progress was made with the said programme.
The Commission believes that action in the following areas could greatly facilitate implementation of the Batho Pele White Paper:

1. Support to departments

Finding

*It was found that there is a general lack of practical skills in the public service to apply the Batho Pele principles.*

Recommendation

To fulfill this need it is **recommended** that:

1. (3) The Department of Public Service and Administration establishes an appropriately resourced support programme.
2. (4) The programme must cover the following types of support:
   - Assistance by consultants.
   - Detailed guidelines on, for instance, consultation with customers and the setting of standards.
   - Training in the practical aspects of applying the Batho Pele principles.
   - Rigorous monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of the White Paper.

2. Integration of the Service Delivery Improvement Programme with other management initiatives in departments

Finding

*It was found that the Service Delivery Improvement Programme is frequently seen as a separate campaign from the normal day to day business of the department.*

Recommendation
Since service delivery is the main business of departments it is **recommended** that:

(1) Their strategic and business objectives should include their service delivery objectives, that is the service standards, access targets and productivity improvement objectives, to increase value for money required by the Batho Pele policy.

(2) All management measures, i.e. -

- strategic and business plans;
- budgets;
- organisation structure;
- transformation programme;
- human resources plan;
- facilities plans;
- business processes;
- job descriptions; and
- performance management

must be geared to service delivery.

(c) The results of consultation with customers should be analysed and presented in the form of management reports to policy and planning meetings where decisions about the type and level of service are taken.

### 3. Alignment of service delivery capacity with the Service Delivery Improvement Programme

**Finding**

*It was found that departments frequently place demands for improved and even new services on service delivery units, without calculating the full costs and impact of proposed changes. Heads of units cope with this by compromising on one aspect of service in favour of the required improvement on another aspect.*

**Recommendation**
It is **recommended** that:

(1) Service delivery capacity, that is -

- post establishment;
- establishment of service points/offices;
- facilities;
- resources like books, medicine, equipment; and
- budget

must be aligned with required improvements in -

- quantity;
- quality;
- level of service;
- efficiency; and
- introduction of new services.

(b) Good costing systems must be developed which will ensure that improvements in one aspect is not achieved at the cost of deterioration in another aspect.

4. **Identifying the service delivery improvement gap and how to achieve the improvement to bridge the gap**

**Finding**

*It was found that Service Delivery Improvement Programmes are simply listings of consultation arrangements, standards, complaints procedures, etc., as required by the “model format for service delivery improvement programme plan” in the White Paper (Appendix B of the White Paper).*

**Recommendation**

To improve the quality, quantity and efficiency level of service, or to introduce new services, it is **recommended** that:

(1) Departments indicate exactly how the improvements will be achieved by utilising the eight-step process spelled out in the White Paper that includes “identifying the improvement gap” and “gearing up for delivery”.*
(2) When new services are being introduced or improvement in efficiency is required, departments must indicate the effect of such initiatives on -

- the need for investing in more resources;
- improving business processes;
- training of staff;
- better resource allocation; and
- better management.

Something must be changed, otherwise nothing will change - it will be business as usual.

5. **Applying the Batho Pele principles should make a practical difference to the day to day work of front-line personnel**

**Finding**

*It was found that the Batho Pele policy has not yet changed the daily tasks of front-line personnel. It is a very practical policy and must not be seen as an add-on to the main business of departments. It is the main business of departments.*

**Recommendation**

To improve service delivery in all sectors of the public service, it is **recommended** that the service rendering and/or the business processes producing the service, be redesigned so that applying the Batho Pele principles makes a difference to the daily tasks (making up a business process) of for instance, teachers, nurses, warders, policemen, prosecutors, magistrates and home affairs clerks.

6. **The Batho Pele principles should be integrated into the performance management system of the Department**

**Finding**

*It was found that performance management systems have not yet been adjusted to establish clear links between a department’s service delivery*
Recommendation

It is recommended that:

1. The performance management systems of departments be adjusted to establish clear links between the service delivery performance of the department and the individual performance of staff members.

2. Such a performance management system should meet the following requirements:

   - A department must be structured in such a manner that responsibility for service delivery performance is clearly allocated.
   - A measuring system must be implemented that measure performance against standard.
   - Front-line staff must be held accountable for the conformity of their output with the standard, as well as middle managers for action plans and use of resources to enable front-line staff to deliver better services and the senior managers for the implementation of the policies and strategic and business plans that determine the service delivery priorities of the department.
   - Service delivery must clearly be the main subject on the agenda of regular management review meetings.
   - Individual personnel performance evaluation, and suitable rewards, must be based on these same service delivery outputs.